

**National Foundation
for Educational Research**



**Participation in ensemble music making by
young people of minority ethnic origin**

Final Report

**Caroline Filmer-Sankey, David Pye, Kerensa White,
Geoff Taggart**

March 2005

Acknowledgements

The NFER team wish to thank everyone who took part in this study. This includes those individual experts who were involved in the initial telephone interviews as well as the staff and young people from the schools and community organisations, who gave so generously of their time. Particular thanks are also due to Larry Westland at Music for Youth, Kathryn Deane at Sound Sense, and Sally Stote at Youth Music for their guidance and support. In addition we would like to thank Anna Macaulay and Audrey Tabary at NFER, as well as our Research Data Services (RDS) team, our statistician Emma Scott, and our project administrators, Vanessa Burns and Anne McNeil, for all their efforts on our behalf.

The following schools and organisations were involved in the fieldwork phase of the study:

Secondary

Golden Hillock School and Specialist Sports College, Birmingham
Highgate Wood School, London
Waverley School, Birmingham
Whitefield Fishponds Community School, Bristol

Primary

Easton Church of England Primary School, Bristol
Marlborough Junior School, Birmingham
May Park Primary School, Bristol
Montgomery Primary School, Birmingham
Rokesly Junior School, London
Starbank Primary School, Birmingham

Community music organisations

Diaspora
Drum Runners.

Executive Summary

Introduction

Youth Music commissioned the National Foundation for Educational Research (NFER) to conduct a preliminary study to investigate the participation in ensemble music making by young people of minority ethnic origin of secondary school age. The study takes as its premise the fact that young people from minority ethnic groups tend not to be involved in ensemble music making in the formal school context, and to a lesser extent, in the informal context.

About the study

The main aims of the study were to identify:

- the extent to which young people of minority ethnic origin are represented in ensemble music making organised at school and by community music organisations
- the characteristics of young people involved in ensemble music making
- the strategies employed to encourage participation of young people of minority ethnic origin in ensemble music making.

The study was in three phases. It began in March 2004 and was completed in January 2005. In Phase One, ten telephone interviews were conducted with key individuals to explore issues relating to the study. These interviews helped to inform the next two phases of the study. In Phase Two, questionnaire surveys were sent to 497 heads of music in secondary schools and to 295 community music organisations. In Phase Three, case study activity took place with four secondary schools and two community music organisations. In each school, interviews were held with the head of music, the headteacher or members of the Senior Management Team (SMT) and two groups of young people. In addition, six telephone interviews were conducted with a range of senior staff in feeder primary schools. In the community music organisations, interviews were held with music leaders and young people.

Key messages

Provision in schools

While the majority of schools surveyed offered tuition for GCSE music, only 20 per cent offered instrument and theory grades, and schools were more likely to provide tuition in western instruments than non-western instruments. Similarly, the music curriculum was felt to be largely focused around western rather than other musical genres, making it possibly less accessible to young people of minority ethnic origin. Though young people may not necessarily

learn the instrumental skills, their interest in music (in all its various forms) appeared to be high.

The most frequent events which young people participated in at school were concerts. Whilst these provide performance experience to young people, the preponderance of traditional music performance activity may make these less appealing to young people of minority ethnic origin. This is not to say that these young people are uninterested in orchestras and choirs, for example, but that their interest is elsewhere (for example, hip hop, garage and R&B).

Provision in community music organisations

Most of the community music organisations surveyed provided for a range of participants and offered both music tuition and performances. In over half, activities centred on singing and composing, and the remainder worked with classical or computer/electronic music. This suggests that, in organisations that are not bound by a set syllabus or timetable constraints, there may be more opportunity to provide activity that links directly to the interests of young people involved.

Age

The age-related trends observed were considered to apply to all young people, regardless of ethnic origin.

In the school survey and case study interviews, respondents suggested that levels of participation decreased in year 6, before transition to secondary school, and in year 9 in the transition from key stage 3 to key stage 4. Reasons given for the trends included peer pressure, family expectation, lack of positive role models and pressure from other subjects, particularly when young people embarked on their GCSE courses.

Similar trends were observed in the community music organisations, who said that primary aged children and young people in years 7 to 9 enjoyed music more and had fewer inhibitions than older young people. Half of the organisations surveyed, however, did not think there were any trends in participation related to age.

Gender

The gender-related trends observed were considered to affect all young people, regardless of ethnic origin.

In the schools and community music organisations, approximately half the respondents said that girls were more likely to participate in music-making activities than boys.

Respondents in the school survey and interviewees in the case study schools commented that there was evidence of gender-stereotyping in the activities preferred by boys and girls. Whilst girls liked playing keyboards, string and woodwind instruments, and singing in choirs, boys preferred MC-ing, drumming and music technology.

Ethnicity

Respondents said that levels of participation in music-making activities in schools were lower among young people of minority ethnic origin than young people of white origin both in and outside of the curriculum.

Half the respondents in the schools' survey thought that there were trends for young people of minority ethnic origin to play keyboard, piano, and string instruments, including guitar, but not woodwind and brass instruments.

Differences between ethnic groups in terms of levels of participation in ensemble music making were also perceived by participants in the study. In the school survey the majority of respondents thought white British young people would participate in ensemble music making, whereas only half the respondents thought that young people of black African, black Caribbean, Indian, and Chinese origin would participate. A smaller number of respondents thought young people of Pakistani, Bangladeshi or other Asian ethnic origin would participate.

Participants in all phases of the study suggested several interrelating factors that might account for the variation in levels of participation. These included: lack of relevant music education provided; logistical and financial constraints; religious belief; parental perceptions and cultural traditions.

Strategies to encourage participation

Despite concern about the lack of young people from minority ethnic groups participating in ensemble music making, it was apparent that there were few actual strategies in place within schools. Strategies that some schools had used were the inclusion of non-western musical genres in the curriculum, cultural events, and the involvement of musicians of minority ethnic origin.

Half the community music organisations in our survey said they had developed strategies to target provision accordingly and had held activities related to the cultural background of minority ethnic young people.

Strategies considered to be effective in encouraging more young people of minority ethnic origin to participate were to provide subsidies for music-making activities, encourage parents to support their children, provide access to musicians of minority ethnic origin as positive role models, provide more training and support to music leaders, and publicise and widen opportunities in the community.

Issues for consideration

Organisations (schools and community music organisations) seeking to encourage the participation in ensemble music making by young people of minority ethnic origin will wish to consider that they:

- continue to ensure that their music activities incorporate elements which are of interest to all young people, regardless of ethnicity.
- continue to encourage the active involvement of young people from minority ethnic groups in Out of School Hours Learning (OSHL) activity.
- consider the specific cultural factors that mitigate against participation of young people from different ethnic groups.
- as far as possible, ring fence funding to ensure that young people can take up a musical instrument.
- as far as possible, encourage the involvement of musicians of minority ethnic origin to act as positive role models for young people. This involvement should be more than tokenistic.
- support events that showcase the musical culture and traditions of minority ethnic groups.
- have up to date music policies that highlight strategies and approaches for encouraging the involvement of young people of minority ethnic origin.
- should be encouraged not to view non-western music as homogenous, but rather be aware of the different traditions.
- make every attempt to engage with local community, religious and parental groups.
- should work more closely together to encourage greater links between in and out of school music-making activity.

More specifically, schools seeking to encourage the participation in ensemble music making by young people of minority ethnic origin will wish to consider that they continue to:

- ensure that their music curriculum incorporates elements which are of interest to all young people, regardless of ethnicity.
- encourage and develop a cross-curricular approach to the study of music, by bringing it into other subject areas.
- develop cross-phase activity to ensure that involvement in music is sustained as young people move from the primary to the secondary sector.

In their partnership with schools LEA music services may wish to:

- ensure that, as far as possible, the provision that they offer is attractive to the interests of all young people.
- consider the recruitment of more staff of minority ethnic origin.

Examination and Music Boards seeking to encourage the participation in ensemble music making by young people of minority ethnic origin will wish to consider the following:

- The Qualifications and Curriculum Authority (QCA) and the examination boards should continue to explore ways in which their programmes of study incorporate different musical genres and musical skills.

Policy makers and others interested in increasing the participation in ensemble music making by young people of minority ethnic origin will wish to:

- investigate ways in which organisations could be supported to enable them to develop their provision for young people of minority ethnic origin.

Other suggestions for consideration:

- Efforts should be made by training institutions (both in Further and Higher Education) to make their music provision more attractive to people of minority ethnic origin.
- Policy makers should investigate the strategies most useful in supporting organisations in developing their provision for young people of minority ethnic origin.
- Policy makers and other interested bodies should consider funding further research focusing on the involvement of young people of minority ethnic origin in music-making activity. This could investigate differences in participation between minority ethnic groups, and the factors that may account for these.

Contents

1.	Introduction	1
2.	Context	2
2.1	Research background	2
2.2	Participation in music of young people of minority ethnic origin	2
2.3	Muslim participation in music	3
2.4	Instrumental music tuition and cultural repertoire	4
2.5	Arts participation of adults of minority ethnic origin	5
3.	Methodology	7
3.1	Introduction	7
3.2	Aims	7
3.3	Approaches	7
4.	Telephone interviews	11
4.1	Introduction	11
4.2	Analysis	11
5.	The survey data	16
5.1	Heads of music	16
5.2	Community music organisations	27
5.3	Analysis of the two surveys	36
6.	The Case Studies	39
6.1	School case studies	39
6.2	The community organisations	57
6.3	Conclusions	66
7.	Overview	67
7.1	Introduction	67
7.2	Areas of investigation	67
7.3	Provision and access	67
7.4	Trends in participation	68
7.5	Strategies to encourage participation	73
7.6	Concluding remarks	74
8.	Issues for consideration	75
9.	References	77

Appendix 1	80
Appendix 2	83
Appendix 3	83
Appendix 4	84
Appendix 5: Technical Appendix	106

1. Introduction

This preliminary study raises issues and themes relating to the involvement of young people of minority ethnic origin in ensemble music making. It takes as its premise the fact that young people from these groups, according to relevant research, for example, Halstead (1994) and Hallam and Rogers (2003), tend not to be involved in ensemble music making in the formal school context. Drawing on this research and the knowledge of key individuals and agencies in the field, this study provides evidence of the current situation. It is not a comprehensive overview, but it does raise a number of issues to be considered in the future.

During the course of this evaluation (March 2004 to January 2005), the issue of participation of young people in school music was raised in a number of texts and initiatives, including the autumn 2004 *Music Manifesto* (DfES, 2004) and the Endangered Species Programme (Youth Music, 2004). Both of these highlight a range of issues that have relevance to our study. What is evident from them, is that there is an understanding that music ‘has a unique contribution to make to education’ (DfES, 2004, p. 1), and that its place in the curriculum must be maintained. With regard to this study, we have taken as our premise that: ‘Music is important for the social and cultural values it represents and promotes, and for the communities it can help to build and to unite’ (p. 1).

In addition, the recent debate about the quality of music education (see, for example, Goodall, 2004, and Morrison, 2005) has provided further contextual material in which to place the study.

Youth Music commissioned this study to investigate the extent of participation in music of young people from minority ethnic groups. In an increasingly multi-cultural society in which issues of self, community and kinship have been heightened by recent global events, the role of music in bringing communities together, regardless of ethnicity, appears to be increasingly important. O’Neill *et al.* (2001) noted that ‘music is one of the most important ways in which young people define and express their identity’ (p. 1). Therefore, this study is a timely one, as it provides a snapshot of the current situation and suggestions for future music provision.

2. Context

2.1 Research background

There is an acknowledged lack of research on the participation of young people of minority ethnic origin in formal music education. As the British Educational Research Association (BERA) Music Education Review Group (2001) stated:

Although a large amount of research has been undertaken on the learning methods of various ethnic groups around the world, relatively little investigation has taken place concerning the relationship of different ethnic/religious groups to formal music education in the UK.
(p. 28)

Nevertheless, there is some specific literature relevant to this study, relating to:

- participation in music of young people of minority ethnic origin
- Muslim participation in music
- instrumental music tuition and cultural repertoire
- arts participation of adults of minority ethnic origin.

Each of these themes is outlined below.

2.2 Participation in music of young people of minority ethnic origin

There are a number of different ways in which young people can be involved in music-making activities: formal activities organised by schools within school time; informal activities organised by schools out of school time and by community music organisations; and non-formal activities at home, within peer groups, and in faith settings (such as gospel choirs). Most of the available research literature focuses on provision in and by schools.

The National Curriculum includes considerable coverage of world music. All children should therefore have opportunities to compose, perform and listen to a variety of music, both individually and in groups. However, the BERA Professional User Review, *How is Music Learning Celebrated and Developed?*, recommended that: ‘music curricula should be regularly reviewed to ensure that they reflect and celebrate the wider community’s musical diversity’ (Welch and Adams, 2003). In addition, the Qualifications and Curriculum Authority (QCA) in their section on the role of music within

the curriculum noted that: ‘The national curriculum programme of study and the QCA/DfES schemes of work for music provide starting points for valuing diversity and challenging racism in the classroom’ (QCA, 200?, p. 1).

Harland *et al.* (2000), in their study of the effects and effectiveness of arts education in secondary schools in England and Wales, found that over a quarter of young people were involved in ensemble music making and just under a quarter learned a musical instrument, though the researchers were unable to identify a relationship between ethnic origin and learning an instrument. In addition to this, they found that, compared with white pupils, those of minority ethnic origin were slightly more likely to participate in extra-curricular arts activities, though overall, participation in music making was found to be more closely linked to age and social class than to ethnicity. A decline in participation was observed around the transition from primary to secondary school, and again at the age of 15. O’Neill *et al.* (2001) found a similar situation in their 2001 report on the music participation of young people in years 6 and 7.

2.3 Muslim participation in music

Harland *et al.* (2000) found no significant differences between the participation of young people of minority ethnic origin and those of white origin, and no evidence of negative attitudes towards music from the families of young people of minority ethnic origin:

No strong relationship was evident between perceived parental interest in the arts and ethnic background of the pupils ... non-white pupils were slightly more likely to perceive a parental interest in music, drama and dance. (p. 530)

Nevertheless, their research did not distinguish between the attitudes of young people from different ethnic and religious groups.

The relationship between western music and the faith of Islam is one area that has been widely reported. A number of researchers have described the particular difficulties that Muslim young people may face with regard to music education at school. Halstead (1994), for example, stated: ‘It is extremely rare to find Muslim children in the maintained sector who choose to study music to examination level or take part in extra-curricular music activities’ (p. 143).

Halstead suggested a number of reasons for this:

- some Muslim organisations have distributed leaflets warning parents of the dangers of music in schools
- confusion is caused by the fact that there is no precise equivalent in the Arabic language for the English word ‘music’

- sensuous music is prohibited under shari‘a (Islamic religious law)
- music which is specifically related to a religion other than Islam is prohibited under shari‘a
- many Muslim families want their children to obtain qualifications which will enable them to achieve professional status and high incomes, and subjects like music are seen as unnecessary.

2.4 Instrumental music tuition and cultural repertoire

In Peggie’s report, *Tuning Up: a New Look at Instrumental Music Teaching* (Peggie, 2002), the author observed: ‘In considering equal opportunity issues we cannot simply lump all music together’ (p. 8). Peggie pointed out that: ‘the UK is a multi-cultural society, and infrastructures which appear to be appropriate to the European Classical tradition in music might be completely inappropriate to other cultures’ (p. 9). He also argued that provision of a diverse musical repertoire was still rooted in conventionally notated forms: ‘The music all *looks* like EC [European Classical] traditional music when it comes printed out in instrument tutors and ensemble arrangements. Musical literacy takes primacy over musical oracy’ (p. 14). In addition to this, he observed that:

the largest group of non-European instruments taught (sitar and tabla) belongs to an equally exclusive classical music tradition which cannot be thought of as in any sense a popular ethnic alternative to the EC traditions. (p. 15)

As with other research in this field, Peggie was unable to find any correlation between demographic profile and the range of music and/or instruments taught. This led him to conclude: ‘There is clearly no simple relationship between musical genre, second or third generation ethnic group and demand for learning specific instruments’ (p. 16).

A survey of Local Education Authorities’ Music Services published in 2003 found evidence of increasing attention to issues of social inclusion in relation to gender, ethnicity, special educational needs and social deprivation (Hallam and Rogers, 2003). Nevertheless, their report agrees with that of Peggie (2002) on the issue of cultural approaches to instrumental teaching: ‘Overwhelmingly, pupils [are] taught within the western classical tradition’ (p. 44). This is despite the fact that schools were found to have access to a range of music from other cultures including: African Caribbean, Asian, Indonesian and South American. In relation to the provision of instrumental music tuition to individuals of different ethnic origins, they found evidence of some disparity in take up: ‘On average 14 per cent of white pupils, ten per cent of pupils of mixed race, and 9 per cent of pupils of African Caribbean and Chinese origin received tuition. The groups served least well were Pakistani

and Bangladeshi' (p. 28). They also commented on the general lack of information about young people's involvement in ensembles.

The recent OFSTED report (2004) on the provision of music services in 15 local authorities, supports the findings of earlier research, noting that in terms of what types of music are generally being offered by schools, these:

tend to represent Western European classical traditions or repertoire from music theatre and film music. Pupils are too rarely given the opportunity to extend their technique and preference through performing non-tonal, rhythmically irregular or dissonant music or music from a wider range of cultures and traditions. (p. 13)

2.5 Arts participation of adults of minority ethnic origin

In 1993, the Harris Research Centre investigated black and Asian attitudes to the arts in Birmingham. From group discussions with adults of minority ethnic origin, they found that, overall, 'arts provision was considered to be White Arts' and 'difficult to relate to because it was not linked to their cultural heritage' (p. 18). They noted that the 'underlying barrier to attendance would appear to be one of alienation' (p. 15).

In addition to this, a recent large scale study carried out by the Office for National Statistics (Bridgwood *et al.*, 2003) investigated attendance, participation and attitudes to the arts and culture among adults of minority ethnic origin in England. The research revealed differences between minority ethnic groups.

Other research has shown that the costs associated with participation in cultural and arts events can be an important factor relating to non-attendance. Both the Harris Research Centre (1993) and Skelton *et al.* (2002) found that cost was perceived to be a barrier for attendance at such events. The Harris Research Centre, for example, found that their respondents considered most art genres to be expensive, with Asian respondents, in particular, sensitive to cost because their frame of reference involved whole family activities. In addition to this, the expense of buying or hiring instruments and taking instrumental lessons could prohibit participation in ensemble music-making activities.

This study utilised existing research to provide a conceptual frame in which the research was placed. The structure of the study was such that different groups were provided with the opportunity (be it through interviews or surveys) to give their views on the participation in ensemble music making by

young people of minority ethnic origin. This report provides the opportunity for their views to be presented.

3. Methodology

3.1 Introduction

This section describes the aims of the study and approaches used.

3.2 Aims

In March 2004 NFER was commissioned by Youth Music to conduct a preliminary study into the participation of young people (ages 11-18) in ensemble music making. The main aims of the study were:

- to identify the extent to which young people of minority ethnic origin are represented in ensemble music making organised at school
- to identify the extent to which young people of minority ethnic origin are represented in ensemble music making organised by community music organisations
- to ascertain the types of events in which young people participate
- to identify any trends in minority ethnic participation in ensemble music making related to age and gender
- to explore the influences on participation and non-participation in ensemble music making among young people of minority ethnic origin
- to consider the different kinds of music repertoire that are attractive to young people of minority ethnic origin
- to ascertain the views of young people and their teachers on the extent to which parents of minority ethnic origin support their children's participation in ensembles
- to ascertain the main factors contributing to the apparent low incidence of young people of minority ethnic origin participating in ensembles organised with the formal education sector.

3.3 Approaches

The study began in March 2004 and was completed in January 2005. The main data collection exercises took place during the summer and autumn of 2004. Data collection consisted of three main phases.

3.3.1 Qualitative data collection

Qualitative data was collected in Phases One and Three of the preliminary study.

Telephone interviews (Phase One)

In June 2004, ten telephone interviews were conducted with key individuals involved in the provision of ensemble music making within community music organisations. The selection of interviewees was based on:

- NFER's prior knowledge of the work of these individuals
- recommendations from Youth Music
- recommendations from key individuals and agencies.

Amongst the organisations selected for the interviews, four were national youth organisations (three orchestras and one choir) providing music tuition and opportunities for young people to learn music in a structured environment. They had all been operating for more than 20 years and had considerable experience of working with all groups of young people. Two organisations were music service providers (local authority music services), two targeted provision at young people of minority ethnic origin, and another two were independent bodies supporting community musicians.

Case studies (Phase Three)

Between November 2004 and January 2005, case study activity took place with four secondary schools and two music organisations. The samples were chosen from the respondents to the questionnaire surveys who had said they were willing to take part in further research. Selection of schools was based on a number of variables, including:

- percentage of young people of minority ethnic origin on roll
- range of minority ethnic groups in the school
- geographical location
- type of local education authority (London, unitary, metropolitan and county)
- size of school
- mixed rather than single sex.

In each school, interviews were held with the head of music, the headteacher or members of the Senior Management Team (SMT), and two groups of young people. In total, the NFER team spoke with four heads of music, two headteachers, four deputy headteachers, one head of creative arts, and 52 young people (both male and female).

A semi-structured interview schedule was developed that focused on a range of issues, including:

-
- music provision in the school
 - trends in participation in ensemble music making
 - strategies to encourage participation in ensemble music making.

We also spoke with headteachers of six feeder primary schools with a view to finding out about their perceptions of music within the curriculum and their views on the provision of music in the secondary phase. In addition, we asked them about the extent of partnership working between their schools and the local secondary schools, and about issues relating to the impact of transition from the primary to the secondary phase on participation in music-making activity.

Community music organisations

Two community music organisations were involved in case study activity in January 2005. Interviews were conducted with two music leaders, one musician and ten young people. Selection of the community organisations was based on the following criteria:

- percentage of young people of minority ethnic origin attending
- range of minority ethnic groups involved
- type of organisation
- geographical location
- mixed rather than single sex.

The purpose of the interviews with music leaders in community music organisations and young people involved was to gain their perceptions of the provision made for young people to engage in ensemble music-making activity outside of the school context. A semi-structured interview schedule was developed that covered a range of issues, similar to those raised with the schools.

3.3.2 Quantitative data collection

Quantitative data was collected in questionnaire surveys of both heads of music in secondary schools and to music leaders in community music organisations.

Heads of music

Questionnaires were distributed to 497 heads of music in secondary schools in September 2004. A total of 165 people responded (a response rate of 33 per cent). The majority of these were teachers with responsibility for music with a variety of job titles, including 'heads of music', 'directors of music' and 'coordinators of music'. A small proportion of respondents (four per cent) were other teachers within the music department. The schools responding

were generally representative of the school population as a whole, with the exception of designation of school (see Appendix 4 (Technical Appendix) for further details).

Community music organisations

Questionnaires were distributed to 295 community music organisations that worked with young people aged 11-18, in September 2004. The sample of community music organisations was selected by a third party, Sound Sense. Sound Sense supplied NFER with the contact details of the organisations, as well as a named contact in the organisation, to enable NFER to administer the questionnaire.

A total of 62 individuals responded (a response rate of 21 per cent). Ten of the respondents returned the questionnaire, explaining that they did not entirely meet the specification for the study. Reasons included the fact that they did not work with young people, or that they were no longer involved in community music. In addition to this, it became evident, after distribution of the questionnaires, that the sample included national as well as community-based organisations and private individuals. This may account for the relatively low response rate. It should be noted that the findings emanating from the community music organisation survey must be treated with caution, owing to the low response rate achieved.

The respondents worked in a variety of organisations, including arts organisations (nine responses), workshop providers (eight responses), multi-cultural organisations (seven responses), local authority-based organisations (six responses) and orchestras/brass bands (six responses).

4. Telephone interviews

4.1 Introduction

Phase One comprised ten telephone interviews with directors, managers or education managers and administrators of community music making organisations in England. A semi-structured interview was developed (see Appendix 1) that focused on their organisation, their views on music-making provision, trends in participation, young people's music-making preferences, and any initiatives organisations were involved in to encourage the participation of young people of minority ethnic origin in music. Each interview lasted approximately 30 minutes.

4.2 Analysis

In broad terms, four key areas emerged from the findings:

- music-making provision
- music genres and types of organisation
- trends in participation
- future initiatives.

4.2.1 Provision

There was a variety of opinion among the ten interviewees as to whether there was sufficient music provision for young people, both in and outside of school. Half of the participants felt there was sufficient provision for those young people who wanted to attend ensemble music-making activities. One respondent said, for example, that 'anyone who wanted to play would find provision'. Yet, several interviewees thought that, although provision existed, it was targeted at those young people who were already interested in music. One interviewee explained that 'there is provision available, it is the getting involved that is the problem'.

Those who felt that there was insufficient provision thought that LEAs and schools were not doing enough to promote music opportunities. One interviewee said that her organisation had been formed because there was a perception that there was not enough opportunity for music in schools. Another said that he suspected provision was inadequate, but that it was difficult to say what broader provision might generally be available. He believed there was a lot of unseen music making taking place, for example, young people composing in their bedrooms or playing in bands in garages, but that this was not formally recognised.

Likewise, there were a variety of opinion with regard to provision for and take-up of young people of minority ethnic origin. Six interviewees felt there

were low numbers of young people of minority ethnic origin participating in ensemble music making, in spite of efforts to address such under-representation. One reason for this was felt to be the small percentage of young people of minority ethnic origin in their locality, which was predominantly white. However, organisations providing western music (including symphony orchestras, choirs and jazz bands), commented that young people of minority ethnic origin were involved in music making which was representative of their own cultural backgrounds, and therefore did not participate in western music to such an extent. These organisations found it difficult to engage young people of minority ethnic backgrounds because of the music genres they offered.

Despite the issues and challenges raised, there were examples of successful approaches, but these were not widespread. Interviewees made reference to ten separate interventions (both initiatives and programmes), which aimed to develop ensemble music-making opportunities for young people of minority ethnic origin. These interventions involved professional musicians working with young people, either in community groups or in schools, to allow them access to a range of musical genres.

The aims of these interventions varied, but generally focused around:

- encouraging more young people of minority ethnic origin to take part in western music
- providing more opportunities for all young people to become involved with world music
- targeting specific groups of young people to enable them to experience different forms of ensemble music making (such as providing young African-Caribbean people with the opportunity to experience music making in the ensemble context).

One interviewee explained that, in his organisation, their ‘activities are open access, recruiting all children’. They encouraged involvement of young people by working with the LEA music advisory services, local agencies, and schools and by developing relevant publicity material. Another explained how they worked with artists from minority ethnic groups, to illustrate to young people that they provided a range of music genres. This approach was described as successful in encouraging young people of black origin to participate. The key factor in this was that the musicians involved in this activity were themselves of minority ethnic origin, and were seen as positive role models for the group.

4.2.2 Participation

Interviewees were asked whether their organisations monitored trends in the participation of young people of minority ethnic origin in ensemble music making. Six collected this data, though those which gathered this information were not necessarily the ones who provided services specifically to young

people of minority ethnic origin. Two organisations said they collected data as it was a requirement of their sponsors.

One pattern identified by interviewees was that young people of minority ethnic origin were participating in their own cultural music, within organisations such as those focusing on Asian arts, community groups (for example, gospel choirs) or other non-school environments. Those interviewees who provided activity specifically for young people of minority ethnic origin explained that there was considerable interest and demand for the projects and workshops they ran. Despite this considerable interest in activities provided by a third party, one interviewee said that young people of minority ethnic origin were more involved in groups provided by their own communities. These groups provided activity that related to the musical and cultural genres of particular ethnic groups.

A majority commented on the low number of Muslim young people involved in ensemble music making. They felt that there were several key factors that could explain this. These were perceived to be related to both the status of music as an academic subject, the place of music within Islamic belief, and parental perceptions, as one interviewee noted:

Muslim children normally stay out of music: they are a tough sector to crack. They are quite vocal about music making not being of a high status: they frown upon music. Some children withdraw from music because of their strict religion. Family and parents' viewpoints affect what the children want to and can do.

Two interviewees also reported low numbers of African-Caribbean young people participating in classical music. Reasons given for this related to the apparent lack of opportunities for African-Caribbean young people to experience classical music from an early age, and also the fact that engagement in this type of music may not be perceived by peers as being attractive.

Two interviewees (both of whom were involved in music provision for young people of minority ethnic origin) mentioned age-related trends amongst young people of minority ethnic origin participating in ensemble music making. They noted that participation decreased in year 6 (especially for Asian young people). This reduction in participation was attributed to a combination of factors, such as family expectations, peer pressure and a lack of role models. One interviewee explained that 'Asian parents [want] their children to excel academically', and that 'music [was] the first thing to go off the agenda'. Another commented that music was 'a very middle class western ideal for parents. Minority ethnic parents may not have the same ideals for their children'.

Despite the majority of those interviewed highlighting concerns, a small number did not feel that low participation by young people of minority ethnic origin was an issue and warranted particular action. They explained that some young people of minority ethnic origin simply did not want to play western music. One respondent said ‘those not in sympathy with western music do not want to join. The repertoire will have a bias. Some children will be excluded through choice.’ In addition, it was noted that certain genres of non-western music focused on solo playing and therefore did not lend themselves to an ensemble approach.

4.2.3 Future initiatives

Interviewees were asked what could be done in the future to encourage greater participation of young people of minority ethnic origin in ensemble music making. Four main themes emerged from their comments. These included:

- widening opportunities for young people of minority ethnic origin
- providing positive role models of minority ethnic origin
- increased collaboration between LEAs, schools and community music organisations
- increased funding.

The majority of interviewees suggested that music providers should pursue wider opportunities for all young people to participate in all sorts of music genres. Respondents also said that music providers needed to be more self-evaluative and recognise that there are barriers that prevent young people of minority ethnic origin from participating in ensemble music making. It was felt by interviewees that, once it had been accepted that there were these barriers, organisations could put in place systems and structures to address these.

Three participants suggested that positive role models would encourage greater participation and provide inspiration for young people of minority ethnic origin. Interviewees thought that young people aspire to role models of the same ethnic background as themselves when considering participating in music making.

Three participants recommended more collaborative work between LEAs, schools and community music organisations. One interviewee said that ‘various organisations need to draw their resources together in order to be more active’.

Two participants said that funding should be made available to help young people purchase musical instruments or participate in instrumental music lessons, activities and events. This would help all young people, including

those from minority ethnic backgrounds. One interviewee said it is necessary to be 'proactively encouraging existing music makers and policy makers to create positive funding and training opportunities'.

5. The survey data

The second phase comprised questionnaire surveys of secondary schools and community music organisations. Two separate questionnaires were developed in conjunction with Youth Music and Sound Sense: one for heads of music in secondary schools (see Appendix 2), and one for music leaders in community music organisations (see Appendix 3). The questionnaires focused on three main areas:

- music provision and access for young people in schools and music organisations
- characteristics of young people involved in ensemble music making
- strategies to encourage participation of young people of minority ethnic origin in ensemble music making.

5.1 Heads of music

5.1.1 Staffing

Heads of music were asked how many full time equivalent (FTE) and peripatetic staff there were in their department. Of those who responded, over three quarters (83 per cent) had up to two FTE teachers in their departments. The number of peripatetic staff visiting schools ranged from zero to 21 per week (a variation linked in part to the size of individual schools), with an average of seven teachers.

5.1.2 Courses offered

The majority of respondents (89 per cent) reported that their schools did offer young people an opportunity to take qualifications. Most of these (97 per cent) offered courses for GCSE music and 15 per cent offered courses to AS/A2 level. The examination boards most commonly noted were Edexcel (63 per cent of respondents), The Assessment and Qualifications Alliance (AQA), (30 per cent of respondents) and Oxford, Cambridge and RSA Examinations Board (OCR), (25 per cent of respondents). In addition to this, 20 per cent of respondents said that instrument and theory grades were on offer at their schools.

5.1.3 Music provision and access

Heads of music were asked for more detailed information concerning music provision and access for young people in their school. The three areas investigated were:

- instrumental tuition
- ensemble music-making activities outside school hours

- participation in music events.

Instrumental tuition

Heads of music were asked to outline, from a long list of instruments, which instrumental tuition was available to young people in their school. Table 1 shows the instruments for which tuition was most widely available.

Table 1 Instrumental tuition offered by schools

Instrumental tuition:	%
Flute	90
Violin	89
Clarinet	89
Western drums	88
Saxophone	85
Trumpet	83
Electric keyboard	82
Electric guitar	81
N =	165

A series of single response items

Tabulated percentages refer to those who said they did offer tuition for the instrument

Their responses revealed that, for two or even three of the instruments in each of the main categories (string, percussion, wind, brass and electrical), tuition was on offer in relatively high proportions of schools. For example, for wind instruments, flute and clarinet were the instruments on offer most widely, with 90 and 89 per cent of respondents saying that their school provided flute and clarinet tuition respectively. Likewise, for electrical instruments, 82 per cent of respondents commented that tuition for keyboard was available and 81 per cent said the electric guitar was available.

Table 2 shows the instruments for which tuition was least widely available:

Table 2 Instrumental tuition least available in schools

Instrumental tuition:	%
Steel drums	19
Synthesiser	19
Mixer	18
Tabla	18
Gamelan	10
Sitar	8
Harmonica	2
N =	165

A series of single response items

Tabulated percentages refer to those who said they did offer tuition for the instrument

Tables 1 and 2 show that tuition in what might be termed western instruments, (flute and violin, for example) was more likely to be provided in the schools surveyed than tuition for instruments from non-western cultures.

Ensemble music-making activities outside school hours

Heads of music were asked whether their school provided opportunities for young people to participate in ensemble music-making activities outside of standard curriculum time. Their responses are shown in Table 3:

Table 3 Music opportunities provided outside curriculum time

	Choir	Orchestra	Brass band	Recorder group
	%	%	%	%
During lunch breaks	76	36	27	27
After normal school hours	46	47	17	8
At weekends	6	5	2	1
During school holidays	4	1	1	0
No provision	7	33	64	70
N =				165

A series of multiple response questions

More than one answer could be given so percentages do not sum to 100

As the table shows, ensemble music-making activities tended to take place during lunch breaks and after normal school hours. Choir was the most frequent activity: approximately three quarters of respondents said singing activity took place during lunch break and half said after school. There was

some overlap in their responses, because in some schools choir was held at both times. In schools with orchestras, more rehearsals were arranged after school than during lunch break. Lower proportions of respondents reported that recorder groups and brass bands were taking place during lunch breaks and after normal school hours.

In addition to choir, orchestra, brass band and recorder group, three quarters of respondents said that other music groups were held outside curriculum time. These included wind ensemble (24 per cent), jazz ensemble or band (24 per cent), and percussion ensemble (21 per cent). As before, these activities were arranged predominantly during lunch break and after school.

Participation

When heads of music were asked to specify, from a pre-determined list, which music events young people in their school participated in, their responses showed that young people participated most in concerts. A high proportion of the 165 respondents (92 per cent) said that young people played and/or sang in winter or Christmas concerts at school, 89 per cent mentioned summer concerts and 82 per cent mentioned concerts at other times of the year. In addition to this, respondents were asked to specify other musical events or activities which young people in their school participated in. A substantial list of events was generated, which included music workshops, festivals, brass bands, and church events, among other things. Many respondents, however, were less specific, referring to dramatic productions (15 responses), events in the local community (15 responses) and music productions (14 responses), though there may be some overlap in these categories.

5.1.4 Characteristics of young people involved in ensemble music making

Heads of music were asked about their views on the characteristics of young people involved in ensemble music making with respect to their gender, age and ethnicity.

Gender

Approximately half of the 165 respondents noted that gender-related trends were apparent. For 18 per cent this question was not applicable because their school was single sex. Five per cent did not respond to this question.

Of those respondents who felt there were gender-related trends, 67 per cent felt that girls were more likely to participate in ensemble music-making activities than boys. By way of contrast, a small proportion (eight per cent) felt that boys were more likely to participate in ensemble music-making activities than girls. When asked whether girls or boys were more confident when participating in music-making activities, over half the respondents did not express an opinion either way; 33 per cent thought that girls were more

confident than boys; and 16 per cent thought that boys were more confident than girls.

Table 4 Gender-related trends in schools

Gender-related trends:	Agree %	Neither agree or disagree %	Disagree %	No response %
Boys more likely to participate more than girls	8	24	64	4
Girls more likely to participate more than boys	67	17	14	1
Boys more confident when participating than girls	16	55	28	1
Girls more confident when participating than boys	33	52	14	1
N=				86

A series of single response items

Due to rounding, percentages may not sum to 100

When given an opportunity to note whether they felt any other gender-related trends were apparent, 36 of the heads of music felt there were. The gender-related trends most commonly quoted were ‘a division between instruments [as in a difference between those instruments that were selected by boys and girls]’ (17 responses) and the ‘type of music activity’ (15 responses). This can be interpreted to mean that levels of participation of boys and girls were dependent on the range of instruments and kinds of activities on offer.

In addition to this, heads of music were also asked why they thought gender-related trends were or were not a feature in their school. A total of 113 respondents said they thought gender-related trends were apparent and 57 respondents thought they were not. Those who reported gender-related trends (relating to the greater participation of girls) gave a number of explanations. These included ‘due to peer pressure’ (19 per cent), ‘girls sing more than boys’ (11 per cent), and ‘music is a more feminine subject’ (nine per cent). Those who reported no gender-related trends explained that ‘pupils are given equal encouragement’ (34 per cent) and that ‘a diversity of activities are offered’ (20 per cent).

Age

Just over half the respondents felt that age-related trends were noticeable and 42 per cent felt they were not. Six per cent did not respond to this question.

The 86 heads of music who agreed that age-trends were noticeable were asked whether they felt that music participation of young people decreased at any stage between years 7 and 11 (ages 11-16). Their responses showed an overall

trend for young people to participate less in the later years, with year 9 being the point where music participation was thought to decrease the most. When asked to comment on age-related trends, 59 per cent of the 86 respondents thought a decrease in participation occurred in year 9, 47 per cent in year 10 and 48 per cent in year 11. These trends were not perceived as clearly in years 7 and 8, where respondents were divided in their opinions as to whether participation decreased or not. Only one of the 86 respondents thought there was no decrease in participation with age.

Heads of music were also asked to explain why they felt age-related trends were or were not a feature in their school. Approximately two-thirds of the 86 respondents who felt that age-related trends were apparent gave explanations for age-related trends. These included:

- peer pressure (18 responses)
- pressure of exams at key stage 4 (16 responses)
- large range of other unspecified opportunities (ten responses)
- changes in levels of participation between the primary and secondary phases (eight responses).

The second of these reasons may help to explain why young people's music participation decreases when they reach year 9, as this is an important year where they make decisions about GCSE choices and when music is no longer a compulsory element of the curriculum. As one respondent explained: 'in years 10 and 11, exam pressures force them to stop'.

The most frequent explanations given by those who felt that age-related trends were not a feature in their school were that young people of all ages liked to participate and that there was a wide range of activities available to all age groups. (These reasons parallel those given by respondents who reported no gender-related trends.)

Ethnicity

The third characteristic that heads of music were asked about was young people's minority ethnic origin and whether they felt this affected participation in music making. There were three strands to the investigation:

- a comparison of levels of participation of young people of white and minority ethnic origin in ensemble music making
- levels of participation in ensemble music making by young people of different ethnic origins
- a comparison of numbers of young people of white and minority ethnic origin learning musical instruments.

Responses showed that over half the sample (59 per cent) felt that a smaller proportion of young people of minority ethnic origin took part in music

compared with young people of white origin whereas only eight per cent thought a greater number of young people of minority ethnic origin participated in ensemble music making compared to young people of white origin. In addition to this, 20 per cent felt participation was about the same, and ten per cent said they did not know.

When heads of music were asked to comment on their response, those who felt that a smaller proportion of young people of minority ethnic origin took part in music than young people of white origin (98 responses) gave a number of responses. Their explanations included:

- Muslim/Asian young people are not included in music activity (eight per cent), as one respondent explained: ‘some Muslim families think music is Haram [forbidden]’
- Some young people of minority ethnic origin are excluded for religious reasons (seven per cent)
- Some young people of (unspecified) minority ethnic origin do not have parental support (seven per cent), as one respondent explained: ‘the barrier to be overcome is persuading parents of minority ethnic children that musical participation is worthwhile and valuable’.

The most frequent comment from the 13 respondents who felt that a greater proportion of young people of minority ethnic origin participated was that there was a large proportion of minority ethnic groups in the school. Of those 33 respondents who felt proportions were about the same, just under half of these explained that ethnicity does not affect participation.

Respondents were asked how likely it was that young people from different ethnic groups would participate in ensemble music-making activities in their school. Table 5 shows their responses:

Table 5 Views on how likely it is that young people of particular ethnic groups participate in ensemble music-making activities

	Likely %	Don't know %	Unlikely %	N/A %	More than 1 box ticked %	No response %
White British	90	4	2	0	0	4
Black African	53	11	19	12	0	6
Indian	47	12	22	12	1	7
Black Caribbean	47	14	15	17	0	7
Chinese	46	15	13	16	1	9
Irish	42	22	3	25	0	8
Other black origin	32	26	9	22	0	12
Other white origin	30	33	2	0	0	13
Pakistani	27	16	32	16	1	9
Other Asian origin	21	24	12	27	0	16
Bangladeshi	19	23	25	24	1	8
N =						165

A series of single response items

Due to rounding, percentages may not sum to 100

As the table shows, 90 per cent of respondents noted that white British young people were likely to participate in ensemble music-making activities. Approximately 50 per cent of respondents felt that young people of black African and black Caribbean origin were likely to participate in ensemble music making. Similarly, just under 50 per cent of respondents thought that Indian and Chinese young people were likely to take part in ensemble music making. On the other hand, respondents thought that fewer young people from other Asian groups were likely to take part, particularly those of Pakistani and Bangladeshi origin, where the corresponding figures were 27 per cent and 19 per cent respectively.

When heads of music were asked whether they had noticed differences between young people of minority ethnic origin and those of white origin in terms of learning particular musical instruments, 53 per cent said they had not, and 41 per cent said they had. Seven per cent did not respond.

Of those 87 respondents who did not feel there were differences, over three quarters did not comment on their response, and a small proportion (nine per

cent) said that all young people were encouraged to play instruments regardless of ethnic origin, as one head of music said: 'students from diverse backgrounds learn all instruments offered'.

The 67 respondents who said that there were differences gave a variety of reasons, but these were not consistent. Sixteen respondents said that few young people of minority ethnic origin learn instruments and nine said that young people of minority ethnic origin were not interested in 'orchestral' instruments, but they did not specify what these instruments were. A small number said that young people of minority ethnic origin were not interested in flute, woodwind, or brass instruments (four responses). On the other hand, 11 respondents said that the piano and string instruments were popular with young people of Asian origin, and another nine thought that young people of minority ethnic origin tended to learn keyboard or guitar. Other comments included:

- Young people of minority ethnic origin lose interest in participating (four responses)
- White young people are not interested in non-western instruments (four responses).

These comments, though not very specific, appear to show a trend for young people of minority ethnic origin to play keyboard, piano, and string instruments, including guitar, but not those from the woodwind and brass sections.

5.1.5 Strategies to encourage participation

Heads of music were asked about events and strategies to encourage the participation of young people of minority ethnic origin in ensemble music making.

Music events

When respondents were asked whether their school had held any music events related to the cultural background of young people of minority ethnic origin in the last academic year (2003/04), 50 per cent of respondents said they had not, and 42 per cent said they had. Four per cent of respondents did not know and four per cent gave no response.

The 69 respondents who said they had held such events were asked to describe two events held in the last academic year. A variety of events were listed, with the five most frequent responses being:

- African drumming workshops (16 responses)
- evenings of music and dance around the world (15 responses)
- multi-cultural workshops (15 responses)

-
- gamelan workshops and activities (11 responses)
 - musician, or musician in residence, of minority ethnic origin (eight responses).

These figures show that general world music events, as well as events focused on specific non-western instruments such as African drums and the gamelan, were taking place in a sizeable minority of schools.

Strategies to encourage participation

When heads of music were asked specifically whether their school had recently developed any strategies to encourage young people of minority ethnic origin to participate in ensemble music-making activities, 58 per cent said they had not and 30 per cent said they had. The others did not know (seven per cent), or did not respond (six per cent).

The 49 heads of music who had developed strategies mentioned a variety of approaches. The five most common were:

- non-western music in lessons/curriculum time (13 responses)
- access to non-western instrumental tuition (11 responses)
- activities related to young people's minority ethnic origin (nine responses)
- visits to and from groups of minority ethnic origin across the Arts (four responses)
- buying non-western instruments (four responses).

It is encouraging to see that there appear to be strategies in place in some schools to improve the accessibility of non-western music and instruments for young people.

In addition to this, respondents were asked whether they agreed or disagreed as to whether a range of proposed strategies would encourage young people of minority ethnic origin to participate in ensemble music making. The strategies and their responses are shown in Table 6.

Table 6 Views on strategies used to help encourage more young people of minority ethnic origin to participate in ensemble music-making events

	Agree %	Neither agree or disagree %	Disagree %	No response %
Subsidising the cost of music-making activities	82	11	4	2
Subsidising the cost of instruments for young people to own/hire	81	12	4	2
Organising visits to and from musicians/groups of minority ethnic origin	81	14	3	2
Encouraging parents of minority ethnic origin to support their children's participation in music-making activities	79	15	3	2
Forming partnerships with community music organisations	76	19	2	2
Providing access to non-western instrumental tuition for young people	75	19	2	4
Recruiting music teachers of minority ethnic origin	69	26	2	4
Publicising opportunities for involvement in existing music groups	67	25	4	4
Forming partnerships with other schools	58	35	6	2
Including more examples of non-western music in the National curriculum	47	33	17	4
N =				165

A series of single response items

Due to rounding, percentages may not sum to 100

Financial support, such as subsidising the cost of music-making activities (82 per cent) or the cost of instruments for young people to own or hire (81 per cent), were the strategies which most respondents agreed would encourage greater participation of young people of minority ethnic origin. A similar proportion of heads of music felt that organising visits to and from musicians of minority ethnic origin would help to encourage participation. Those who responded also felt that, as well as encouraging young people of minority ethnic origin to participate in ensemble music making, it was important to encourage their parents to support them in participating (79 per cent).

The strategy which the smallest number of respondents agreed (47 per cent) would encourage greater participation amongst young people of minority ethnic origin was to include more examples of non-western music in the curriculum, yet this was the most common strategy which schools had developed to encourage participation.

Heads of music were asked to give any further comments on the topic. The most frequent responses were:

- Young people of minority ethnic origin are treated no differently (18 responses)
- There are small numbers of young people from minority ethnic backgrounds (12 responses)
- It is worthwhile to persuade parents to participate (eight responses)
- The cost of lessons is a factor (eight responses).

5.2 Community music organisations

Owing to the low response rate, the number of responses (n) has been reported rather than percentages throughout this section.

5.2.1 Characteristics of music organisations

Of those organisations that responded, 18 ran music workshops for the community, 11 held instrumental productions/performance activities, nine ran multi-cultural music workshops and nine conducted a variety of music projects. The majority of respondents reported that they provided music tuition and/or music performances. When asked which other activities they provided, a range of responses was given. The most frequent activities provided are shown in Table 7.

Table 7 Type of activity provided

Activity:	n
Music tuition	37
Music performances	43
Workshops	16
Training and development activities (including for teachers)	6
Music therapy	5
N =	52

A multiple response question. Respondents could give more than one answer

Young people and staff involved

Owing to the different kinds of organisations in the sample, the number of participants that they typically worked with at any one time varied greatly, but just over half of respondents (29 responses) said they worked with between three and 30 participants. When asked how many participants fell into certain age brackets, responses indicated that organisations worked with young people of all ages as well as adults.

The number of adults working with 11-18 year olds in their organisation varied greatly but over half of respondents (34) said that there were between one and ten. Those organisations who did not work with young people aged 11 to 18 were instructed not to complete the remainder of the questionnaire. This applied to nine respondents and therefore for the remaining questions the overall number of respondents (n) was 43.

When asked what groups of people organisations provided for, respondents reported that they provided activities for a range of people. Nearly half indicated that they provided activities for young people in general (22 responses). Fourteen respondents said that they provided activities for any groups of people who wanted to participate. Other organisations said they provided for adults (11 responses) and some specified that they provided for adults with learning difficulties (ten responses).

5.2.2 Music provision and access for young people

Types of music

Respondents were asked to specify, from a list of music genres provided by an expert in the field, which types of music they generally used in their work with young people (11-18 years). The responses are shown in Table 8:

Table 8 Types of music used by organisations

Types of music used:	n
Songwriting/composing	34
Voice	31
Classical	24
Computer/electronic music	21
Pop/rock	21
Jazz	21
Samba	18
Folk	16
Hip-hop	15
DJing/mixing	14
Reggae	11
Gospel	10
Other	21
No response	2
N =	43

A multiple response question. Respondents could give more than one answer

Events

Respondents were asked to describe, from a list, the kinds of events young people in their organisation were involved in. The responses are shown in Table 9:

Table 9 Types of music events young people participate in

Music events:	n
Community-based performances	38
Community workshops	31
School-based performances	31
School workshops	30
Music festivals	28
Masterclasses	18
Residential projects	12
Music competitions	10
Overseas tours	6
Other musical events/activities	10
No response	4
N =	43

A multiple response question. Respondents could give more than one answer

5.2.3 Characteristics of young people involved in ensemble music making

Respondents were asked about their views on the characteristics of young people involved in ensemble music making with respect to their gender, age and minority ethnic origin.

Gender

Respondents were asked what percentage of young people participating in their organisation were male or female. Of the 34 people who responded to the question, the most common response was that their participants were divided equally between males and females (14 responses). Nevertheless, in a small number of organisations the gender split was less equal. Five organisations reported a split of 40:60, male to female, and four organisations reported the reverse, a split of 60:40, male to female.

Of those 21 respondents who felt there were gender-related trends, a higher number felt that girls were more likely to participate in ensemble music-making activities than boys (see Table 10). When asked whether they felt boys or girls was more confident in participating in music-making activities, eight respondents felt that boys were more confident than girls, whereas three

respondents felt that girls were more confident than boys. Seven respondents neither agreed nor disagreed.

Table 10 Gender-related trends in music organisations

Gender-related trends:	Agree n	Neither agree or disagree n	Disagree N	No response n
Boys more likely to participate more than girls	4	6	9	2
Girls more likely to participate more than boys	9	4	4	4
Boys more confident when participating than girls	8	7	5	1
Girls more confident when participating than boys	3	7	9	2
N=				21

A series of single response items

When asked whether they felt any other gender-related trends existed, 11 people said there were and four people said there were not. Six people did not answer this question. A variety of other gender-related trends were reported, but it must be remembered that the number of responses was very small. The comments included:

- Young women need more encouragement to participate in music (two responses)
- Girls are more committed and likely to stick with a programme than boys (two responses)
- Boys are more likely to form rock or punk bands than girls (two responses).

In addition to this, respondents were asked why they thought gender-related trends were or were not a feature in their organisation. Of those 21 people who felt that trends were apparent, four said that different types of activity tended to be gender-related. As one respondent explained, ‘girls are more interested in R&B music sessions and boys are into hip-hop and bhangra music activities’. Another said, ‘boys are often more interested in DJ and rap activity, girls are more interested in ensemble based activity’. Of those 15 people who felt that trends were not visible, four respondents said it was because all young people had equal access in their organisations. Whilst these provide an overview of the thoughts of the twenty one respondents, the numbers involved are so small that the differences they highlight are not statistically significant.

Age

In addition to gender, respondents were asked whether they had noticed any age-related trends among young people in their organisation. Of the 43 respondents, 17 thought that age trends occurred in their organisation, and nearly half (20) felt they did not. Six people did not respond to this question.

The 17 people who agreed that age-trends were noticeable were asked to provide details and possible explanations. Several different trends were mentioned and included:

- Younger children have fewer inhibitions (two responses)
- There is an enormous demand for music-making activities from young people of junior age but less from older young people (two responses)
- There is more pressure of schoolwork (after primary/secondary transition) (two responses)
- There is greater reluctance to participate after the ages of 14 and 15 (two responses), as one respondent remarked: 'Post 14-15, young people tend to be more reluctant to take part in ensemble-based projects.'
- Older young people want to be more independent (two responses).

Ethnicity

The third characteristic that music organisations were asked about was the ethnic origin of young people participating in the organisation.

Respondents were asked what proportion of young people of minority ethnic origin took part in ensemble music making in their organisation compared with young people of white origin. Table 11 shows that 17 people thought that a smaller proportion took part, eight people thought a greater proportion took part and five people thought they were about the same.

Table 11 Proportion of young people of minority ethnic origin participating in music making compared with young people of white origin

Proportion:	n
Greater	8
About the same	5
Smaller	17
Don't know	5
No response	8
N =	43

A single response item

When respondents were asked to comment on their response, the most frequent reasons included:

- There are few young people of minority ethnic origin in this area (13 responses)
- The proportion participating in the organisation reflects the proportion of young people of minority ethnic origin in the area (seven responses)
- The focus of the organisation is on meeting the music-making needs of young people of minority ethnic origin (five responses)
- It is difficult to generalise/depends on other factors (four responses).

In addition to this, respondents were asked whether they had noticed differences between young people of minority ethnic origin and those of white origin in terms of participating in different musical genres. Over half of respondents said they had not (24) and nine said they had. Ten people did not respond to this question. The most frequent details given were:

- Young people are more enthusiastic in music making due to music tradition in their culture (four responses)
- Young people of white origin are more involved in rock and young people of minority ethnic origin are more involved in hip-hop etc (four responses)
- Participation levels of young people of minority ethnic origin are similar to the proportion in the neighbourhood (three responses)
- Young people of minority ethnic origin are not as interested in classical music activities as white young people (two responses).

5.2.4 Strategies to encourage participation

In the final section of the questionnaire, music organisations were asked about activities and strategies to encourage the participation of young people of minority ethnic origin.

Strategies

Twenty respondents said they had developed strategies and 14 said they had not. The others did not know (two responses) or did not respond (seven responses). The 20 who said their organisation had developed strategies mentioned a range of methods. The most common strategies were to:

- encourage or advertise to anyone with an interest in playing music (five responses)
- cater specifically for communities with young people of minority ethnic origin (five responses)
- provide positive role models/ employ tutors of minority ethnic origin (four responses). One respondent commented that their community music organisation was ‘promoting to local communities via musicians from ethnic minorities’
- provide a wide range of music styles (four responses).

Respondents were also asked whether they agreed or disagreed as to whether a range of proposed strategies would encourage young people of minority ethnic origin to participate in ensemble music-making events in their organisation. They also had to indicate if they were carrying out the strategy already. The strategies and their responses are shown in Table 12.

Table 12 Views on strategies used to help encourage more young people of minority ethnic origin to participate in ensemble music-making events

Strategy:	Agree n	Neither agree or disagree n	Disagree n	No response n	Already doing this n
Encouraging parents of minority ethnic origin to support their children's participation in music activities	27	4	0	12	11
Recruiting music teachers of minority ethnic origin	25	7	1	10	12
Provide more training/support for music leaders	25	3	0	15	15
Subsidising the cost of instruments for young people to own/hire	23	3	1	16	12
Organising visits to and from musicians/groups of minority ethnic origin	23	3	2	15	17
Publicising opportunities for involvement in existing music groups	23	3	0	17	19
Forming partnerships with other schools	20	2	0	21	22
Forming partnerships with community music organisations	20	4	0	19	21
Subsidising the cost of music-making activities	19	1	0	23	26
Providing access to non-western instrumental tuition for young people	16	5	2	20	17
Including more examples of non-western music in their repertoire	11	7	3	22	24
N=					43

A series of single response items

The strategies considered most useful were:

- to encourage parents of minority ethnic origin to support their children's participation in music (27 responses)
- to employ more music teachers of minority ethnic origin who can act as role models (25 responses)
- to provide more training and support to music leaders (25 responses).

The strategies considered least useful were:

- to include more examples of non-western music in their repertoire (11 responses)
- to provide access to non-western instrumental tuition (16 responses).

These responses may be lower because several organisations said they were already employing these strategies to encourage young people of minority ethnic origin to participate in music.

Music activities

When respondents were asked whether they had carried out any music activities related to the cultural background of minority ethnic young people in the last 12 months (September 2003 to September 2004), 22 people said their organisation had, and 17 said they had not. Four people did not respond. The most frequent responses were:

- local festivals of music and dance (five responses)
- percussion workshops (four responses)
- multi-cultural workshops in areas with few people of minority ethnic origin (three responses).

Four respondents did not specify particular activities but commented that their whole work focused on cultural diversity and awareness of other cultures.

Finally, respondents were asked to give any further comments on strategies to encourage participation. The most frequent responses included:

- we need to encourage everyone equally (four responses)
- nature of our work means other organisations would be better at encouraging young people of minority ethnic origin to participate (three responses).

5.3 Analysis of the two surveys

The two surveys focused on three main areas: music provision and access for young people, characteristics of young people involved in ensemble music

making and strategies to encourage participation amongst young people of minority ethnic origin.

Outlined below are some of the key similarities and differences between the two surveys. It must be noted that the numbers of respondents were low, in particular for the survey of community music organisations, and direct comparisons between the data are not possible because the questionnaires contained slightly different elements and were focused on different age groups of young people. (school survey 11-16, community music organisations 11-18)

5.3.1 Music provision and access

In schools and community music organisations, singing and songwriting played an important part of their work with young people. In community music organisations, over half of respondents said they used voice and composition in their work and in schools, choirs were the most popular activity outside of standard curriculum time.

5.3.2 Characteristics of young people involved in ensemble music making

Gender

In each of the surveys, approximately half of respondents felt there were gender-related trends. Heads of music and community leaders thought that girls were more likely to participate than boys. Approximately a third of heads of music thought girls were more confident than boys when participating but half expressed no opinion. Of the small number of community leaders who responded, slightly more thought boys were more confident than girls when performing.

Schools and community music organisations both commented that the level of participation of boys and girls was dependent on the kinds of activities on offer. Of those respondents in the school and organisation surveys who commented that there were no gender-related trends, most said it was because all young people had equal encouragement and access to music activities.

Age

In schools, more heads of music felt that there were trends in participation related to age than those who did not. In community music organisations, views were different because slightly more respondents felt that age-related trends were not apparent in their organisation.

In both surveys, respondents felt that year 9 was the point where participation declined. Heads of music said that participation declined with age because of increased peer pressure and pressure of exams on young people. Community

leaders noted that it was because younger children have fewer inhibitions and older children want to be more independent.

Ethnicity

Sixty per cent of respondents in schools said that a smaller proportion of young people of minority ethnic origin participated in ensemble music-making activities compared with young people of white origin. In community music organisations, 17 out of 43 respondents gave the same response. In both surveys, respondents explained that it reflected the proportion of young people of minority ethnic origin in the area. Heads of music also said a smaller proportion of young people of minority ethnic origin participated because of cultural and religious factors as well as a lack of parental support but these factors were not mentioned by community leaders (just one leader mentioned lack of parental support).

In schools, heads of music commented that young people of minority ethnic origin were less likely to play 'orchestral' instruments, such as woodwind and brass, and a small number of community music leaders commented that young people of minority ethnic origin were not as interested in classical music activities.

Strategies to encourage participation

A third of heads of music had developed strategies to encourage young people of minority ethnic origin to participate in ensemble music-making activities. Just under half of respondents in community music organisations said they had developed these. In schools, the most common strategy was to introduce non-western music in lessons whereas in community organisations it was to advertise to everyone interested in playing music.

When asked which strategies respondents thought would be most effective in encouraging young people of minority ethnic origin to participate in music making events, heads of music and community leaders both said that parents needed to be encouraged to support their children's participation and more music teachers and musicians of minority ethnic origin should be employed who could act as role models. In schools, respondents noted that subsidising the cost of activities or instruments should be the priority strategy, and in community organisations, respondents felt that more training and support should be provided to music leaders.

6. The Case Studies

6.1 School case studies

6.1.1 Background

Four secondary schools were involved in Phase Three of the research. All were comprehensive schools with the number of young people on roll ranging from 665 to over 1300. Two of the schools were located in the West Midlands, one in north London and one in Bristol. To contextualise the discussion, a brief outline of each of the four schools is provided.

School One

This school is located in the north of London, with 1326 pupils on roll. There is a rich cultural heritage within the school, with 17 ethnic groups being represented among the young people. The music department has 3.6 full-time/full-time equivalent teachers and 20 peripatetic staff who provide tuition on a wide range of musical instruments.

School Two

This school is located in Bristol, with 889 pupils on roll. There are 16 discrete ethnic groups. The music department has a part-time head of department (0.8), a full-time newly-qualified teacher and five peripatetic staff. Peripatetic staff offer guitar, woodwind, singing, drums and keyboard tuition.

School Three

This school is a community comprehensive and specialist sports college in the West Midlands with 777 pupils on roll. There are 14 different minority ethnic groups which together constitute 98 per cent of the population. More than three-quarters of young people are from Pakistani or Bangladeshi backgrounds. The music department is staffed by a part-time head of department (0.8) and a full-time teacher on the Graduate Teaching Programme. Four peripatetic teachers offer tuition in tabla, woodwind, violin and keyboard.

School Four

This school is in the West Midlands, with 665 pupils on roll. Over 80 per cent of young people speak English as an additional language (EAL) and the majority of young peoples' families originate from Bangladesh or Pakistan. The music department comprises one full-time teacher. There are three regular peripatetic teachers who offer tuition in guitar, drum kit and keyboard.

6.1.2 Provision

Staff and young people were asked about the extent of music provision both within the curriculum and as part of out-of-school-hours-learning (OSHL) activities.

The music curriculum

All the schools provided a range of music activity at key stages 3 and 4. The time allocated to the study of music at key stage 3 (years 7 to 9) varied in the four schools, but ranged from one half-hour to two hours per week. In key stage 4 (years 10 to 11), the amount of time allocated to the subject generally increased (ranging from one to three hours per week) but this was due to the fact that at this key stage, the young people studying music had elected to do it as a GCSE option.

At key stage 3, efforts were being made in all of the schools to make the music curriculum one that would be both enjoyable and accessible to young people. The curriculum was used to develop musical skills, concepts and knowledge as well as introducing young people to a range of different music genres. For example, one teacher described how he introduced African music and dance into lessons, and another said that ‘Bollywood’, ‘world’, Indian and Chinese music was incorporated into lessons. In addition, gamelan, keyboard and drumming activities (using traditions from a range of musical genres) were used. As well as playing and listening skills, some of the schools were using different musical genres to develop compositional techniques, including the study of the ‘raga’ form on tabla.

There was concern that the time allocated to the study of music (between half an hour and two hours per week) was not enough. In an attempt to address this situation, one of the schools had developed an individual instrumental learning scheme. This approach gave young people the opportunity to learn a musical instrument within lesson time and to progress as fast as they could. The main aim of this was that, as far as possible, even if the young people decided not to take music as a GCSE option, they would have the basic grounding in an instrument that would enable them to take it up at a later stage if they so wished.

The efforts made to engage the interest of young people at key stage 3 did appear to have had a positive impact, as the young people we spoke with were keen to describe what they had been studying. For example, as one young person commented: ‘There are lots of facilities in the music room. It’s really enjoyable and there’s a variety of instruments’, and another said that ‘The lessons are fun and you learn a lot. You get enough time for practical. You write it first and then you can play it. We make our own pieces as well, like space music.’

Music activity at key stage 4 (years 10 to 11) was rather different in style and approach to that in key stage 3, as it was now an examinable subject. There were young people of minority ethnic origin studying for GCSE, though it is not possible to say whether there were a greater or smaller percentage of these young people studying than young people of white origin because of the varying composition of the pupil group. This said, two of the schools were making specific efforts to encourage young people (including those of minority ethnic origin) to study music. In one school one of the criteria for entry to the subject was that a pupil should either show some ability on an instrument, in composition, in MC-ing or be a member of a band or choir. It was also noted that The Assessment and Qualifications Alliance (AQA) course was offered at the school and that it was possible to emphasise those areas of the syllabus that were more related to the interests of young people of minority ethnic origin. As one teacher explained:

They can make their own music in school. They can choose the kind of music that they do. Outside school they listen to R&B, hip hop, garage, and rap but they don't learn about them in class. They could, though, compose a piece of music in one of these genres. In year 10 they are learning about salsa and bangra.

Out of school hours learning activity (OSHL)

The lead music teachers were asked about school activities available to young people outside of the standard curriculum. There was evidence of a range of activities that were available to young people before school, at lunchtime and at the end of the school day. It was noted that the time available outside of lessons provided a valuable context in which young people could engage in music-making activity. One way in which this time could be used was to make instruments available for young people to play in an informal practice context. In one school, the engagement of young people with music had altered dramatically since practice rooms and instruments had been made available to them. This is how the lead music teacher described the impact:

...but now everything is unlocked. Students have started to come in before school... students have become more interested in music and ask how they can take this further. I wasn't expecting this...All types of background kids come in, white, Pakistani, Bangladeshi, Somali... maybe because it is an unstructured thing. They can practice keyboards, drums, this has just started happening over the last month.

Lunchtime clubs were also perceived to provide valuable space for young people to express themselves through music. This said, there were felt to be certain logistical issues that had to be addressed for lunchtime activity to be effective. This included issues relating to the organisation of school lunches

and the security of musical instruments. In one school the lunch break was said to be too short for it to be worth providing all types of musical instruments for young people to use. Rather, the school used the lunch break to offer practice time to the choir, samba group, keyboard club and MC club. In other schools, the lunch break provided the time for young people to have instrumental lessons provided either by full-time or peripatetic music staff. In one school for example, tutors offer tuition in tabla, violin, keyboard and woodwind during the lunch break.

All the staff interviewed referred to the wide range of musical activities offered at the end of the school day. Activities provided in the schools included:

- orchestra clubs
- keyboard club
- guitar club
- jazz groups
- choir
- capoeira (Brazilian martial arts music).

Whilst it was felt that providing after-school activities was a positive development, there was some concern about how effective these activities were in encouraging the involvement of young people. In one school it was described how a guitar club took place for two and a half hours after school. There was concern about the safety of young people leaving school relatively late in the evening. Also, in schools where the sessions did not last as long, there was still an attendance issue, as one teacher noted 'the culture of the school is that children do not stay behind after school'.

Partnership working

Those staff interviewed were asked whether they worked in partnership with other schools or community music organisations to provide musical activities or events both within and outside of school. The purpose of this discussion was to gauge the extent to which schools were engaging in partnerships to extend the music provision that they could offer. All schools were involved in activity with external partners, and these appeared to provide activities that extended and enriched the learning experiences of the young people involved. In one school, activity had been provided by the South Asian Arts Development Agency, who worked with young people on bangra, DJ and dance activity. In another, activity had involved Muslim girls in an orchestra for Muslim young women.

Overview of provision

Generally, all the staff we interviewed were content that music provision in their schools was of satisfactory quality but admitted that there was more that could be done for young people of minority ethnic origin. Whilst there were concerted efforts being made to engage young people from minority ethnic groups, it was evident that these efforts were not always successful. For example, in one school, 85 per cent of the pupil population was from the Pakistani, Bengali and Somali communities, yet 40 per cent of those young people taking peripatetic lessons (for example, in guitar, drums and keyboard) were of white origin.

6.1.3 Trends

We asked staff whether they were able to highlight any discernible trends in the participation of young people in ensemble music making. They mentioned three trends:

- gender stereotyping and its impact on participation
- decrease in participation in music-making activity in year 9 and beyond
- higher levels of participation in OSHL activity amongst African-Caribbean young people compared to other minority ethnic groups.

Whilst the third trend is specifically related to the involvement of young people of minority ethnic origin, the other two are applicable to young people more generally (including those from minority ethnic groups).

Gender stereotyping

Staff commented that, despite their efforts, there was evidence of gender stereotyping in the involvement of young people of both minority and majority ethnic groups in music making. Whilst girls preferred to play keyboards, strings, woodwind instruments or to belong in a choir, boys preferred MC-ing, music technology, drums and guitars. These patterns were considered to affect all young people, regardless of ethnicity. The interviews with young people generally corroborated this trend.

Decrease in participation

Those interviewed described a decrease in participation of young people in music-making activities as they moved from key stage 3 to key stage 4. This was felt to be a natural development, as the study of music became non-compulsory at that time. Those who participated in music in key stage 4 were those young people that had decided to study music at GCSE-level. One teacher noted that as young people move from key stage 3 ‘... they either leave or get serious’. Staff were able to explain the reduction in music activity within the curriculum but less able to account for trends in OSHL activity.

There was a perception that young people in year 10 (including those who are not studying for GCSE) do participate in OSHL activity, but that by year 11 this decreases. One teacher described the situation in her school:

In year 10, young people are still involved with music activities (even those not doing music GCSE). [However] in year 11, hardly any who don't do music GCSE come along to clubs. Kids often prioritise and do other subjects...and PE after school, especially when they get to year 11.

Participation in OSHL activity

Three of the heads of music described African-Caribbean young people as more likely to participate in OSHL music making than young people of Pakistani or Bangladeshi ethnicity.

6.1.4 Explanations

Heads of music and headteachers and members of the SMT were asked to consider reasons for the trends that they had highlighted, specifically in relation to participation by young people of minority ethnic origin. The reasons they provided, included:

- approaches to delivering the music curriculum
- lack of relevance
- lack of role models
- logistical constraints
- financial constraints
- parental support
- religious belief
- cultural impact
- informal music-making activity
- tokenism
- quality of peripatetic music provision.

Approaches

Despite the efforts that schools were making to engage young people of minority ethnic origin, there was some concern that the whole way in which music was portrayed and approached in schools was having an impact on specific groups of minority ethnic young people. There was uncertainty as to how the situation could be amended, but at the same time there was a realisation that there was an issue in the way in which young people were selected to take part in activity (especially in the context of performance). In

one school, there was an open audition policy for 'acts' that wanted to take part in school concerts. The lead music teacher noted that the audition process had received some criticism as it was said to be unwelcoming and unnecessarily daunting to young people, especially those of minority ethnic origin. Whilst he acknowledged that this may have been the case he was unsure about how to alter the approach. This said, he did suggest that perhaps it would be better if young people were approached directly to take part, rather than having to go through an audition process.

Lack of relevance

Lead music teachers and other senior staff noted that one reason for lower involvement of young people of minority ethnic origin in music making related to the apparent lack of relevance of school music provision offered to these particular groups. One head of music said that even though the GCSE music syllabus had broadened to incorporate reggae, blues and Indian music for example, this was not necessarily contemporary with, or of interest to, young people of minority ethnic origin. Whilst a number of her minority ethnic students were able to incorporate the specific musical interests that they had (for example, singing and MC-ing) she felt that the GCSE course still put a higher value on the traditional forms of music making, as she perceived them. She described how the syllabus placed greater value on playing an instrument as opposed to mixing electronic music. She concluded by noting that the very structure of ensemble music tended to mitigate against involvement of young people of minority ethnic origin: 'Yes, for minority ethnic kids, music is just not seen as relevant, particularly getting together as a group playing four or five different parts'.

A deputy head in another school provided further information on how the GCSE music syllabus works against the involvement of young people from minority ethnic groups. She noted that the GCSE course is perceived by young people as being more demanding than other arts subjects: she cited in particular the expectation that students will have studied a musical instrument to an examination standard. This, allied to the perception of young people that the course has little relevance to them, was said to be a possible explanation for the lower involvement of young people from minority ethnic groups.

Role models

Those interviewed said that the lack of appropriate role models was a key reason as to why young people from minority ethnic groups did not generally take part in ensemble music-making activity. Though there were felt to be some role models that were attractive to young people, these were generally popular music artists (for example Lemar, Dizzee Rascal, Jamelia and Usher) who performed on their own, rather than in an ensemble context. Of specific concern was the apparent lack of role models of minority ethnic origin amongst peripatetic and full-time music staff. One lead music teacher

described how the local education authority (LEA) offered African drumming courses, but that the musician delivering the courses was not African himself. This was felt to be symptomatic of the more general situation in LEA music services and schools, where there was a lack of teachers and musicians from minority ethnic backgrounds. Another lead music teacher provided context for this issue by outlining his experiences of tutoring on post-graduate teacher training music courses. He said that for as long as he could remember none of the participants had been of minority ethnic origin.

Logistical constraints

A number of those interviewed described the pressures and constraints on music activity in school, which though predominantly logistic, were felt to have an impact on the participation of young people of minority ethnic origin. A key issue was said to be the timing of music lessons and workshops, both within and outside of school time. One lead music teacher described how some teachers were not supportive of young people learning musical instruments, as lessons with peripatetic music staff were held during curriculum time: 'There is sometimes negativity [from teachers] towards kids taking peripatetic lessons because they miss their lessons... I try and get them in at lunchtimes'. It was felt that young people would pick up on this apparent lack of support from their teachers, and decide that, after all, it was not worth pursuing instrumental tuition, if it impacted on their schoolwork or their relationship with certain members of staff.

The problems associated with scheduling music activity were not only confined to the school day. It was noted that the timing of after school activity also raised a number of issues. The main issue as far as after school activity was concerned, was attendance. Whilst there was support for OSHL activity, there were problems with attendance that needed to be addressed. Though encouraging the attendance of young people (regardless of their ethnic origin) at OSHL activity was difficult enough, it was felt that young people from minority ethnic groups were at a particular disadvantage. The main reason for this was that there was concern amongst minority ethnic groups of young people travelling home alone at night (this was of particular concern with Muslim young women). In addition, OSHL activity sometimes clashed with attendance at local mosques.

Financial pressures

Whilst financial issues were seen as a factor in the extent to which young people from minority ethnic groups participated in ensemble music making, there was uncertainty as to the relative impact on involvement. Contrary views were expressed as to whether young people from minority ethnic groups were failing to participate because of financial reasons. In one school, a lead music teacher said that those young people who participated in music were generally those who had received private instrumental tuition and by definition, came

from more affluent backgrounds. In another school, it was noted that more African than Jamaican young people were involved in music-making activity because the African community was more affluent than its Jamaican counterpart.

Despite this, the lead music teachers in the two other schools felt that funding was not the issue. One of the lead music teachers noted that: 'instruments could be offered on a platter, but take-up is still not there', this suggesting that it was not money, but other factors, that were important. A similar view was expressed by the deputy headteacher of the fourth school who generally agreed that financial pressures were not a reason for non-participation: 'By and large there are not huge monetary problems: generally thinking I think the money could be found'. What is evident is that whilst financial issues may play a role in whether young people take part in music making, this is not perceived to be the main reason for non-participation.

Parental Support

The level of support that young people received from their parents for music participation was perceived by those interviewed to have an impact on their involvement. In three of the four schools, the lead music teachers described how parents in their schools perceived the studying of music as lacking intellectual rigour and having a low academic status. In one of these schools, young people have to make a choice between studying GCSE music or GCSE business studies or law. It was noted that many parents of young people of minority ethnic origin encouraged them to select the business studies or law option as music was seen to have a lower academic status. This view was corroborated by the young people themselves, who described the negative perceptions that their parents had of music as an academic subject. According to the young people, their parents were supportive of them 'doing music for fun', but not for serious academic study. One young person commented: 'My parents are okay about me doing music as long as I'm doing law and other academic subjects. It's all right to do one thing that I like. That's fine.' Other young people described how their parents felt that music was not sufficiently vocational or 'useful' to warrant studying it in detail. In one school, parental disapproval towards music extended to young people concealing the fact that they actually played an instrument. One young person described how: 'My dad doesn't know that I play the flute' and another that: 'My parents don't know, but my brothers know about it'. The situation was summarised by one lead music teacher, who described the situation in their school:

Then you have parents of Pakistani origin who actively prohibit their children from taking up an instrument. That is chronic right across the school, I have children who have to hide the fact that they do music lessons from their parents...

That young people are actually hiding the fact that they engage in musical activities from their parents is illustrative of the depth of opinion that must exist in some homes regarding the study of music.

Religious belief

The impact of religious belief on participation in music making was highlighted in all the schools that we visited. Rather than this being an issue for young people from all minority ethnic groups, it only appeared to have relevance for Muslim young people. A number of those we interviewed highlighted the concern that some Muslim parents had regarding the irreligious nature of music. In addition, others noted the innate link that some Muslim parents made between music (in its popular form) and performance, which is often seen as immodest, particularly performances by girls. One lead music teacher noted that Muslim parents had complained on two occasions about their daughters performing on stage, although this was mainly due to their dress rather than the music itself.

Cultural impact

Though it was perceived that religious belief could have a negative impact on the participation of young people from minority ethnic groups, the opposite was also felt to be true. The majority of those interviewed recognised that school was only one forum in which young people could engage in music-making activity. For a number of minority ethnic groups, music was perceived to be at the heart of family activity. The engagement in music-making activity lay outside of the school context, and resided in the church or the temple. Many described how young people in their schools were members of gospel or church choirs, and it was in this context that they engaged in music-making activity both outside of the formal school context and separate from it. So although young people from certain minority ethnic groups were engaging in music-making activity, there appeared to be very little linkage between this community-based music making and music-making provision in schools.

Informal music making activity

Music-making activity that took place in the home was also perceived to be an area that schools were not engaging with. Though it was felt that many young people were meeting informally to form groups or bands that performed in friends' houses for example, there was no link between this activity and music making in schools. Again, this was a case of the formal approach to music making in schools not being relevant to or having cognisance with non-formal music making in the home. One headteacher described how the school had a large number of Turkish pupils. The school had found it challenging to involve young people in music-making activity. The school had provided funds for Turkish pupils to develop their own newspaper in their mother tongue. The newspaper had been published and it contained many references

to music, though very few of the Turkish young people engaged in music in the school. It was evident that Turkish young people were musically aware, but all of this was outside of the school context.

Tokenism

There was some concern that young people of minority ethnic origin were being discouraged from participating in music-making activity because of tokenism. Whilst this issue was raised by a lead music teacher in only one of the schools, it does highlight an important issue. He noted that attempts to encourage participation of minority ethnic young people often centred around them being offered the opportunity to learn instruments from their own cultural heritage (the sitar or tabla for example). He was concerned that this may actually discourage young people from minority ethnic groups as they did not necessarily want to study instruments from their own cultural heritage. Similarly, he did not feel that having a musician of minority ethnic origin would necessarily encourage young people to become involved and this could have negative consequences as it could be viewed as a token gesture, that is, it was more important that the teacher appointed was a good teacher rather than someone who happened to be of minority ethnic origin.

Quality of peripatetic music provision

This was an issue that was raised with reference to provision of musical instruments that linked to the cultural heritage of specific minority ethnic groups (for example, tabla and sitar). One lead music teacher said that those teachers who taught tabla and sitar at her school had unreasonably high expectations of the pupils and found it difficult to maintain their interest. She speculated that, as these peripatetic music staff were in their 50's and 60's, they may have found working with young people a challenge. The inference here was that the peripatetic staff from minority ethnic groups found it a challenge to work with their students as they had unrealistic ambitions of what they should and could achieve. Meanwhile, the young people were said to have difficulty relating to music professionals that were considerably older than them. Perhaps if there were not such an age gap between the young people and the music professionals, then this situation would not arise.

6.1.5 Issues and challenges

In addition to discussing the trends and reasons for these, we asked interviewees for their perceptions of the main issues and challenges for their schools in encouraging the participation of young people of minority ethnic origin in ensemble music-making activities. Their responses tended to fall into five groups:

- challenging the status quo
- sustainability

- links with the community
- equality of opportunity
- funding.

Status quo

The current situation was said by those interviewed to be self-perpetuating as young people from minority ethnic groups do not participate because very few of their peers do. A number of those interviewed said that their main concern was with 'breaking this cycle of lack of involvement.' For example, interviewees in two schools described how 'getting on that first rung' and that 'making it [participation of young people from minority ethnic groups] happen is an issue'.

Sustainability

The need to sustain involvement was also an issue. This was highlighted by one headteacher who described the way in which young people from minority ethnic groups chose to engage with music making:

There seems to be a preference for the more informal impromptu stuff rather than rehearsals and turning up for performances. When they do a performance in the summer lots of African-Caribbean students will stand up, dance and sing, but they won't get involved in the musicianship and craft of an instrument.

Links with the community

How schools engaged with local communities and minority ethnic groups was described by two music leaders as a challenge that schools had to face. The inference here was that as institutions, schools had not been able to reach out and engage with the local community. It was felt that if there were closer links with the community (with local parental, religious and community groups, for example) then a greater understanding of young people's interests would be developed. One lead music teacher said that she had not been able to develop closer links with community groups because of the pressure on her time. Another was unsure that, even with closer links with community groups, schools would be flexible enough to respond to community needs. For example, he was unsure how his school would react if it had to plan its OSHL activity around the cycle of prayer and tuition at the local mosque. The issue here was that whilst schools generally had good intentions, the parameters in which they worked meant that it was not always possible to fit around the needs of the local community.

Equality of opportunity

All of the staff interviewed stressed the need for music as a subject to be promoted to all young people, and not just those from minority ethnic groups. The reason for this was that it was felt that a greater exposure to music would benefit all young people and provide them with equal opportunity to become involved in music making. This said, one lead music teacher suggested that there needed to be positive discrimination to ensure that young people of minority ethnic origin did in fact take part. For example, he described how he would:

... like to develop a strategy, by getting certain [activity] funded (e.g. DJ lessons) which are free to all students. It has to be strategies which are open to any group, but with the aim in the back of the mind that they are targeting certain groups.

Funding

There was a perception amongst those interviewed that funding in music tended to follow historic patterns rather than being focused on prevailing needs. One lead music teacher commented that: ‘I think [our] music needs to go towards mixing and sampling and using decks. I think... music services need to move with the times’. The perception here was that even though there was a recognition that the way in which young people engage in and with music was developing, both the funding, and the ways in which this funding was spent, still favoured older approaches. The result was that funding was primarily allocated to traditional modes of music engagement (such as orchestras and bands) rather than more contemporary activity (decks and digital musical technology for example).

6.2.6 Strategies for inclusion

Interviewees were asked to describe strategies that they were using in their schools to encourage the involvement in music making of young people of minority ethnic origin. Despite the evident concern about the lack of young people from minority ethnic groups participating in music, and an understanding of the trends and issues and challenges associated with this, it was apparent that there were few actual strategies in place within the case study schools. Where specific strategies were mentioned, they related to the imaginative use of funding streams, the range of musical instrument provision offered and to the hosting of specific events.

Funding streams

Though the issue of funding was mentioned by only one school, it is an important issue. This school, like all others, received its funding through a number of different sources. The lead music teacher suggested that a bringing

together of these funding sources could ensure greater opportunity for more young people to take part in music. He described how the LEA provided funds to pay for those young people eligible for free school meals (FSM) who wish to participate in music. The school also receives funding enabling it to write off any debts owing to it from unpaid music lessons. In addition, the LEA provides a musical instrument hire scheme that is subsidised by the school standards fund. When seen individually, these funding streams can have some impact, but when brought together their impact is greater.

Provision

The range of music provision that schools offered was felt to impact on the extent of involvement of young people of minority ethnic origin. The four case study schools had tried hard to expand their music curriculum to make it more appealing to all young people, with varying success. For example, a wider range of music genres had been included in key stage 3 and there were efforts to incorporate the new music technologies (MC-ing and decks for example). In addition, some of the schools had brought in musicians who specialised in the instruments of particular minority ethnic groups. One school had employed a specialist Saz teacher. The Saz is a Turkish guitar, and it was hoped that this involvement would encourage young people of Turkish origin to engage with this instrument and with music more generally. In addition, the Saz teacher was a Turkish speaker and it was felt that this would further encourage young people to take part. The result was not as positive as the school had hoped, as generally very few Turkish young people became involved.

Special events

The lead music teachers in two of the schools described how organised special events were used to encourage the participation of young people in music. These events were both external to the school (with young people going out of school to attend concerts and events) and activity that the school provided in-house. The in-house activities included concerts and visits to the school by music professionals. Whilst these activities did include young people of minority ethnic origin, they were not specifically focused on these groups, but on the pupil population as a whole.

Impact of the strategies

It is evident that the schools were making concerted efforts to engage young people in music-making activity, but that this was proving to be challenging. The involvement in music of young people of minority ethnic origin was variable, despite the efforts that were being made. That said, there was uncertainty about what was actually being done. In three of the schools, the headteachers stated that they did not set specific targets in music for minority ethnic young people and either did not have a specific policy for music education or were unclear whether one existed. In addition, two out of the four

headteachers interviewed were also unsure about whether their school allocated any specific funding to encourage young people of minority ethnic origin to participate in music. This suggests that even though schools do realise that the involvement of young people of minority ethnic origin is an issue, they are unsure how to proceed, and do not have the strategic issues and approaches in place. However, the paucity of evidence of deliberate strategy in this area should not be seen as suggesting unwillingness or complacency: it is rather that there was general uncertainty about how to proceed. As one lead music teacher concluded: ‘I don’t know, I’m really hitting my head against a wall. You have to do everything you can to encourage them; it’s extremely frustrating’.

6.1.7 Future development

We asked interviewees generally about what they thought should be done to encourage young people of minority ethnic origin to take part in ensemble music-making activity. They were encouraged to look outside of their own school context and provide suggestions that were relevant for all schools. The responses highlighted issues raised in earlier discussions but are important to describe in isolation as they do provide generic suggestions for future development.

Funding

Though there was a diversity of opinion as to the impact of funding on music participation of young people of minority ethnic origin, there was a consensus that funding did need to be made available. It was suggested that for example, if a young person showed interest and commitment to learning a particular musical instrument, the funding should enable the young person to have subsidised or free tuition. In addition, it was said that local music services should become more responsive to the needs of young people from minority ethnic groups. This was not only about offering young people the chance to play traditional musical instruments from minority ethnic cultures (for example, tabla, sitar or gamelan), but about providing funds for professional music systems, digital lighting and mixing decks.

Relevance

The issue of relevance of both the formal and non-formal music curriculum was an issue raised in all the case study schools. Those interviewed said that the music curriculum had to continue to adapt, to ensure it had relevance to and resonance with young people. In addition, it was suggested that music teachers and music professionals had to learn to respect and value the music that young people were making, interested in and listening to.

Early encouragement

As the evidence from this study and other research has shown, the involvement in music decreases as young people become older. Those interviewed were acutely aware of this trend and felt that something could be done to address this. For example, it was suggested that strategies be introduced in year 7 that would encourage greater participation in the future. One interviewee suggested that all young people in year 7 should be allocated an instrument and that this might result in more young people continuing with music as they got older. One teacher said that: 'I will look into doing this 'band method' where every child is allocated an instrument because that might be a strategy'.

Greater partnership working

From earlier discussion, the importance of working in partnership with other schools, community organisations and religious groups, was said to be very important. Those interviewed felt that these links had to be further developed in the future if advances were to be made. This said, there was a realisation that this would be difficult because of the need to invest time and funding to this type of activity.

Different traditions

There was concern that music of different minority ethnic groups was currently viewed as being one and the same thing, but that the situation was far more complex than this. For example, Asian music was seen as one specific type of music, when the reality was actually very different, as this interviewee explained:

I think there is a tendency on our part to view Asian music as a whole, and maybe a lot of the elements which we think of that might fit Pakistani children quite well are Indian and therefore don't engage them very well.

This suggests that the inclusion of different musical genres and traditions into the school curriculum have to be handled with tact and care.

Cross-curricular activity

To encourage greater participation in music making, it was generally felt that more effort had to be made to bring music into other subjects. The benefit of this cross-curricular approach was said to be that young people would be exposed to music through a variety of learning experiences. Rather than just studying music *per se*, they would be able to study it within the context of other learning activity, be it in history, geography or maths for example. It was

hoped that if this approach was developed, then the notions of music having little 'academic' relevance would be challenged.

6.1.8 The Primary School perspective

To contextualise the discussion with staff and young people from the four secondary schools, the study included a tranche of interviews with headteachers/senior teachers in primary schools. We asked each of the lead music teachers in the four secondary schools to nominate up to two feeder primary schools that we could approach to be involved in the study. Details of eight primary schools were passed onto the research team and six of these agreed to take part. Telephone interviews were held with the headteachers/senior teachers of the six primary schools in December 2004. As with the secondary schools, a semi-structured interview schedule was developed that focused around a number of themes including:

- music provision in and out of school
- young people's perception of music
- the impact of the transition from the primary to the secondary phase on participation in music of young people.

It should be noted that the interviews were grounded in the relevant research, (for example O'Neill *et al*, 2001) that highlighted the impact on music making of young people when they moved from the primary to the secondary phase.

The schools

All six schools were in an urban setting with the number of pupils on roll ranging from 260 to 750. Each of the schools had a large number of young people of minority ethnic origin on roll, with rates of eligibility for free school meals (FSM) being higher than the national average.

Music provision

All six schools offered music as part of their curriculum. This was highlighted in the music policy that each of the schools had. Whilst having a policy that made a commitment to music in school, it was generally felt that updates were needed. For example, in one school the music policy was described as 'pretty ancient' and in another that it was 'in need of an update.'

In terms of music provision itself, the discussions focused on development in the primary curriculum (for example, the requirements of the literacy and numeracy strategies) and the impact that this development had on music provision within the schools. The majority of those interviewed described music as a subject that had been marginalised. Despite concern about its

apparent marginalisation, schools were making concerted efforts to create space within the curriculum for music. One headteacher described the current situation:

The position is changing. When literacy and numeracy strategies came into place it cut out anything creative. It was very difficult to timetable music, to fit it in. The Government has since realised what a dire effect it had and they have almost come back full circle with topic and theme weeks and there is a real push now for creativity [music].

All those interviewed noted the importance of having music in the curriculum, as it was felt to provide the context in which young people could express themselves and develop both as individuals and as part of a wider group. One senior teacher, whilst explaining the importance of music, said:

I think it opens doors to children, especially if they aren't so good in maths and English. It informs their life inside and out of school, contributing to the whole child. It also helps them to express themselves.

The inference from this was that music could have specific resonance with, and for, young people who were perhaps less able to express themselves through English, as this was not always their first language.

Of key importance to making music an essential part of the learning process of young people was the need to make the music that was studied have relevance (this highlighting an issue raised by staff in secondary schools). One headteacher commented: 'it [the study of music] has to be something that children can relate to, are able to do and are good at.' Whilst those interviewed perceived the need for relevance, little evidence was provided to substantiate this.

With regard to OSHL activity, it was evident that efforts were being made to engage young people in music activity. Again, the issue of relevance was paramount, with schools bringing in music professionals to provide new learning experiences that extended the curriculum. Interviewees described how their schools had worked with a range of external music providers including arts organisations, LEA music services charitable organisations, and orchestra and ballet companies.

Perceptions

We asked interviewees how they thought young people in their schools perceived music as a subject. Whilst it was perceived that the study of music was generally popular amongst young people, there was some concern that as

young people became older, they became more self-conscious about their own image and what they were prepared to participate in. One headteacher said, of older pupils in her school, that: 'There's a bit of an idea that it's an uncool thing unless it's rapping or hip-hop. That image is still there, especially with the juniors and singing.' The concern over the perception of music that young people hold was mirrored in discussions with secondary school staff.

Interviewees were also asked about other factors which might affect participation of young people of minority ethnic origin. Religion and culture were said to be two factors affecting participation. In one school, it was noted that families of African-Caribbean origin were very supportive of dance and music, but not as supportive of learning a musical instrument. Of particular comment was the perception that Muslim families were concerned about participation in music-making activity amongst their children. One teacher commented: 'I think there is a reluctance to sing initially. We have been told it is because singing isn't a part of their [Muslim] home culture'. This concern mirrored that raised by secondary school staff.

Transition from the primary to secondary phase

The relevant literature (O'Neill, 2001 et al, for example) suggests that participation in music amongst young people decreases as they move from primary to secondary school. We felt that it was important to investigate this issue with staff in the primary phase. It was interesting that a number of staff that we spoke with were unsure about the provision of music in their linked secondary school. This suggests that partnership working (seen as a key feature in encouraging young people of minority ethnic origin to participate in music) between primary and secondary schools was not as developed as it could be. Nevertheless, there was some evidence of collaborative work. For example, one of the secondary schools had offered year 6 pupils the opportunity to attend a pre-transfer, familiarisation day where they were able to experiment with keyboards, tablas and music technology. Other cross-phase activity included:

- visits by music specialists from secondary schools to local primary schools
- music 'road shows' for parents and young people organised by secondary schools.

6.2 The community organisations

The purpose of the case study visits to two community music organisations was to look at emerging themes from the community music organisation survey data and to explore them in greater detail. Interviews were conducted with community music leaders and young people. A semi-structured interview schedule was developed that focused on a range of issues, including:

- music provision within community music organisations
- trends in participation in ensemble music making in relation to gender, age and ethnicity
- issues and challenges faced
- strategies used to encourage greater participation amongst minority ethnic young people
- future developments.

In the first organisation we spoke to the artistic director and the musician who ran the workshop we attended. In the second organisation we spoke with the director. We also spoke to ten young people of minority ethnic origin. These case study visits were completed in January 2005.

It should be remembered that the findings provided in this section are based on data from two community organisations only. Therefore they should be seen as indicative and illustrative of the situation in these two organisations rather than anything more generalisable. This said, issues raised by these two organisations have resonance with findings from the other data.

6.2.1 The organisations

The first organisation is based in the West Midlands. It is a small organisation that 'runs collaborative arts and music projects in a variety of settings'. The director of the organisation explained that she had set the organisation up five years ago 'to work with teams of musicians, so I wasn't working on my own all the time and so I could have more say on how the projects work'. She now works collaboratively with six musicians and a group of them have formed a band which holds workshops in schools. The majority of musicians are of minority ethnic origin, with the exception of the director who is white.

The organisation mainly provides workshops and music groups for children, young people and adults. They work in mainstream and special schools, providing in-school and OSHL activity as well as working with adults. The director explained she worked with a group of musicians who play various musical instruments and genres. The number of workshops the organisation hosts at any one time depends on the availability of funding. She currently obtains funding from the LEA music service, Arts Council England and from charities.

The second organisation is based in the south of England. It provides music to all ages of participants by using drumming, steel pans and junk percussion. The director stated that the organisation aims to provide 'easy access to making music through drumming'. The organisation incorporates all types of music 'from middle Eastern, English to Samba'. It is run by a director who

works with two other professional musicians who are drummers. The director runs this organisation voluntarily and receives no funding. In addition to this work he also works as a freelance percussionist with local councils, youth centres and schools.

Both organisations stressed that they had an open access policy and worked with anyone who wanted to come along to the workshops or groups to play music. Neither organisation specifically targeted minority ethnic young people.

6.2.2 Provision

Both organisations ran various music workshops in different settings, including schools, youth clubs and community halls. These workshops provided an informal setting where participants could play music and perform. In the first organisation we visited a workshop that the director was running in a secondary school in an inner-city area. This after school club was open to all students and provided an informal, friendly environment where the young people learnt to compose and play their own music. As the director explained, ‘the main focus is rhythm and singing and they have an opportunity to generate their own material’. At the end of the project, the young people have the opportunity to perform and record two songs at a professional studio. In the second organisation, the director had recently provided a junk jazz activity workshop for anyone who wanted to attend.

When asked whether the organisations work in partnership with schools or other community music organisations, the director in the first organisation explained she worked with a range of schools, including primary, secondary and special schools. She also worked collaboratively with an organisation providing after school clubs to train some of the after school helpers and to bring other artists in to work with the young people. The other director does some collaborative work with schools and local communities when working as a freelance percussionist.

6.2.3 Trends

Interviewees were asked whether they perceived any trends in their organisation with regard to gender, age and ethnicity. Interviewees’ responses are highlighted below.

Gender

When asked whether they felt participation in music-making activities by young people was influenced by gender, there were differences in opinion amongst interviewees. The director and musician in the first organisation felt

that gender affects which activities young people participate in. Both noted that boys tended to play the drums and girls were more likely to sing. This was evident in the workshop which we attended where three boys played the drums and seven girls sang. The director explained this may be because ‘there are very few female professional instrumentalists, so it comes down to role models’. The director in the second organisation did not think participation was influenced by gender because he felt music appealed to both sexes. Yet, he had noticed that the majority of young people (11-15 year olds) preferred to remain within their own gender groups at the beginning of a project, but as a project developed, girls and boys participated together more.

Age

When asked whether they felt young people’s participation in music-making activities was influenced by their age, interviewees were unsure. Both the director and the musician in the first organisation explained that as young people got older they realised what types of music they wanted to play and were more focused about what they wanted to achieve. As one of the musicians explained, ‘some are much older and are particular about what they want to do. Some are young and can be moulded into something’.

Ethnicity

Interviewees were asked whether they thought any trends were apparent amongst young people of minority ethnic origin participating in ensemble music making. In the first organisation, both the director and the musician described several trends whilst the interviewee in the second organisation was less certain. Trends highlighted by the interviewees included:

- participation of Muslim young people
- participation of African/African-Caribbean young people.

Muslim young people

In both organisations, interviewees said that Muslim young people were less likely to participate in music activities. The director in the first organisation had noticed that Muslim young people (14-15 years) who attended one of her workshops, had hardly ever sung before, largely because of their culture and religion. The other director felt that fewer Muslim young people, particularly girls, participated in music because ‘art and music are not important – poetry is the only acceptable thing for Islamic/Muslim groups’. Nevertheless, the director in the first organisation explained the success of a project she ran for 14 and 15 year old Pakistani young people which focused on them playing Asian music and more traditional classical music with the assistance of a sitar player. Although they had never performed before, the young people really enjoyed the experience.

African and African-Caribbean young people

Interviewees also commented that African and African-Caribbean young people enjoyed participating in ensemble music-making activities and the director in the second organisation felt this was because they 'are more settled and confident in who they are'. In the first organisation, interviewees commented that young girls of black origin were likely to sing because they often sang in their church choirs.

Additional factors

Interviewees were also asked whether they felt other factors affected the level of participation of minority ethnic young people in ensemble music making. Trends highlighted by the interviewees included:

- music genre
- financial constraints
- parental views.

Music genre

Interviewees in the first organisation said that the numbers of young people of minority ethnic origin involved in their workshops were related to the kinds of music they offered. The musician explained that their workshops were successful because they included the types of music such as hip-hop, reggae and jazz, which young people of minority ethnic origin enjoyed. He felt that young people of minority ethnic origin preferred to play instruments such as the keyboard, drum or guitar, rather than woodwind or brass instruments, because this is what they liked listening to. He also said they liked playing instruments such as the dhol drum and tabla. The director in the second organisation felt that it was important for organisations to think about the type of music offered because young people of minority ethnic origin were happy to play western music as well as music of their own culture.

Finance

Only interviewees in the first organisation felt that financial factors affected participation amongst young people of minority ethnic origin. The musician explained that young people of minority ethnic origin in the area he worked tended to come from poor or single-parent families. For many families, music was not seen as a priority because they may not be able to afford for their children to have music tuition, buy or hire instruments or participate in activities.

Parental views

Interviewees in both organisations noted that parental attitudes affected participation levels of young people of minority ethnic origin. One musician in the first organisation said that parents ‘don’t regard it [music] highly, compared to other subjects such as English and maths’. He explained that parents wanted to give their children academic opportunities which they did not have so that they could build a career. The director in the second organisation distinguished between attitudes of parents of different ethnic backgrounds, explaining that African-Caribbean parents were more supportive of music than Asian parents, as it was perceived that Asian parents did not value music as highly.

6.2.4 Issues and challenges

Interviewees were asked what they felt were the main issues and challenges for their organisation in encouraging the participation of young people of minority ethnic origin in ensemble music-making activities. Interviewees had differing opinions but agreed that one of the issues was that if the relevant genres of music were not played, young people were not interested in taking part in the workshops. In the first organisation this is something they were working towards, because the director, who is classically trained, has learnt to incorporate and appreciate music which young people of minority ethnic origin relate to and enjoy in the workshops. The other director felt it was important that young people of minority ethnic origin are able to join in with playing western music as well as their own cultural music.

In the first organisation the director also felt that one of the challenges her organisation faced was commitment from young people and regular attendance at the workshops. She felt this was a particular issue because ‘when you’re a child it’s hard to have a vision of what can be achieved’. She noted that this was applicable to all young people, regardless of gender and ethnicity. The musician suggested a solution to this issue: ‘music teachers have to gain the trust of the minority ethnic young people in order for them to commit’.

6.2.5 Strategies for inclusion

When interviewees were asked whether they used any strategies to encourage young people of minority ethnic origin to participate, interviewees in the first organisation listed several, but the director in the second organisation stressed that none of the strategies he adopted were targeted specifically at young people of minority ethnic origin. The strategies that interviewees felt would encourage greater participation among young people of minority ethnic origin are outlined below.

Provision

Interviewees in both organisations explained that they used specific types of music to encourage greater participation, such as R&B, hip-hop and street music, which young people enjoyed. Both music leaders felt that music projects worked well if they were sustained over a period of time, as one director explained, 'then they [young people] get the chance to develop and rehearse and become really confident about it'. The other director said that community organisations should not 'just parachute in and parachute out...you need to follow up activities', so that participants remained interested in music.

Role models

The interviewees in the first organisation explained that as musicians they played alongside young people and acted as role models. They felt this encouraged young people of minority ethnic origin to participate as they looked up to those musicians of the same ethnic background. Nevertheless, the musician felt that a role model depended entirely on a person's character and enthusiasm, rather than their ethnicity. The director also explained she played a recording of the CD which their band produced at workshops which often impressed the young people and encouraged them to participate.

Funding

The director in the first organisation also stressed that they provided financial subsidies and explained, 'all the clubs are free to children, because otherwise we felt it would put them off'. The musician wanted the local music service to fund lessons and buy or hire instruments so that young people of minority ethnic origin could play classical instruments, as this was uncommon at present. Yet, the director felt that this was not the best strategy because many young people of minority ethnic origin did not want to learn to play orchestral instruments. The director in the second organisation explained that making music with junk percussion was an inexpensive and simple way for everyone to participate in music.

Monitoring

The director in the first organisation explained that she did not monitor the strategies but she recorded who attended the workshops as it was often a requirement for funding. She also evaluated the workshops, by conducting interviews with teachers in schools or adults in other organisations, and often used this material for publicity.

6.2.6 Future development

Interviewees were asked what they felt could be done in organisations in the future to encourage greater participation in music making among young people of minority ethnic origin.

Vision and purpose

The director and musician in the first organisation felt that community music organisations needed to have a clear vision, aim and purpose. The director felt that organisations succeeded when they were artist-led rather than when different musicians were brought together from various places. She said that organisations needed to be ‘organic’.

Training and support for music leaders

The director in the first organisation commented that ‘there should be more opportunities for musicians, especially those who work in education, to be supported to develop their own interests and core skills and exchange information with one another’.

Recognition of music making

The director in the second organisation felt there should be more recognition of the music making that young people of minority ethnic origin participate in within the community and in their home life. He felt ‘it was good to encourage what people are doing already’. Nevertheless, he also noted the importance of community groups providing all types of music working together to ‘succeed, have fun and share knowledge’.

Future development

Lastly, interviewees were asked how they visualised their organisations’ work for young people of minority ethnic origin developing in the future. Both the organisations wanted to continue with the work they were doing, with the aim of holding more long-term projects to enable music to become more embedded within young people’s lives.

6.2.7 Young people

The analysis for the young people of interviewed has been kept separate from the directors’ opinions to allow the young people’s thoughts to be clearly portrayed. The young people we spoke with were all of African-Caribbean origin and ranged in age from 11 to 15 years. We only spoke with young people in the first organisation because the face-to-face visit to the second organisation was cancelled owing to circumstances beyond our control. Interestingly, the workshop which the first organisation ran was held at a school where approximately 60 per cent of the students were Asian and only

15 per cent were African-Caribbean, nevertheless only students of African-Caribbean origin attended the after school workshop.

Participation

Most of the young people we spoke with said they took part in the after school workshop voluntarily because they liked music and enjoyed singing. Two students in year 10 who were taking GCSE music were told by their class music teacher that they had to attend. The young people were excited about participating, and at the prospect of performing in the community and recording two songs at a studio at the end of two terms of workshops.

The young people enjoyed coming to the music sessions because they were given an opportunity to express themselves and played the music which they enjoyed. As one young person said, 'you get to play and sing what you want like R&B, hip-hop and reggae'. They enjoyed the freedom they were given to sing their own lyrics and make their own music which was not something they did in school music lessons. They commented, 'in school we're bored in music and we don't get to listen to music we like, sometimes we have to listen to classical music'.

Gender

Young people were asked which musical instruments they played and a gender divide between different instruments was evident. The boys played drums, including the drum kit, congas and steel pans, and all the girls sang, and played other instruments such as the piano, keyboard, guitar and tabla. The young people explained that they had chosen these instruments because they enjoyed playing them. One boy said he could play along to the types of music he liked with the drums and one girl said she played the piano because a family member had taught her.

Age

The young people said that all ages of young people participated in music. It is interesting to note that at the workshop there were more students from years 7 and 8 than from other year groups.

Parental support

Every young person we spoke with said their family thought that participating in music was a great opportunity. This illustrated that many of the parents of the African-Caribbean young people we spoke with appeared to support their children in their music making. One girl said her father worked on the radio and was proud that she was singing. Another said that her parents were pleased she attended the workshop, 'because they want me to get far in life'.

6.3 Conclusions

This chapter has highlighted the themes and issues raised by staff and young people in primary and secondary schools and community music organisations. These themes have resonance with the telephone interviews, questionnaire surveys and the literature. The final two chapters will look at these issues more closely and provide issues for future consideration.

7. Overview

7.1 Introduction

This chapter provides a review and brief discussion of our findings from the three phases of the study. The purpose of this is to provide a context in which the relevant literature (alluded to throughout the report) can be brought together with our emerging themes and issues. It should be remembered that our study was a preliminary one, in that its purpose was to explore issues relating to the involvement of young people of minority ethnic origin in ensemble music making. It did not set out to provide a comprehensive overview of the current situation. We have deliberately supported our findings with relevant literature as this has provided us with a conceptual frame. Again, we have not used all the literature available but only that which links directly to the research.

7.2 Areas of investigation

There were three main areas of investigation in the study. These were:

- provision of music education and access for young people of minority ethnic origin
- trends in participation in ensemble music making related to age, gender and minority ethnic origin
- strategies to encourage greater participation of young people of minority ethnic origin in ensemble music making.

The findings from the three phases of the study are considered in turn.

7.3 Provision and access

The first focus of the study was to examine the nature of music provision in schools and community organisations.

7.3.1 Provision in schools

While the majority of schools surveyed offered tuition for GCSE music, only 20 per cent offered instrument and theory grades, and schools were more likely to provide tuition in western instruments than non-western instruments. This suggests that, in the schools involved in this study, there is a tendency to focus activity around GCSE music, rather than the traditional music grades. This in itself is of note, as it would appear that the formal structure of instrumental tuition (focusing around the music examining boards) may no longer have resonance. Without this structure, it could be that it is more difficult for young people to gain the instrumental skills required for engagement in ensemble music making. The corollary of this could be that fewer young people are able to take part in such music-making activities. This

said, there is evidence that the music curriculum is developing to be more inclusive as it is opening up to new music genres and influences. Schools in our study were making concerted efforts to develop musical skills and knowledge across a wide range of musical genres (for example, 'world', Indian music, and Chinese music).

Though young people may not necessarily learn the instrumental skills, their interest in music (in all its various forms) appears to be high. Schools appear to be making efforts to capture the interests of young people and these may not link to the traditional forms of musical engagement (for example, orchestras and string ensembles).

Outside normal school hours, mainly during lunch time and after school, choirs, and then orchestras, were the most frequent music-making activities. Whilst these may be the traditional types of group that schools provide, the fact that young people (including those of minority ethnic origin) appear to be engaging less with these, is an issue. It could be that they are precluded from involvement because of their lack of specific instrumental ability or interest (in the context of choirs). In the case study schools, time outside lessons was used to provide opportunities for young people to practice instruments in an informal environment, this suggesting that efforts were being made to encourage young people to become involved.

The most frequent events which young people participated in at school were concerts. Whilst these provide performance experience to young people, the preponderance of traditional music performance activity may make these less appealing to young people of minority ethnic origin. This is not to say that these young people are uninterested in orchestras and choirs for example, but that their interest is elsewhere (for example, hip hop, garage and R&B).

7.3.2 Provision in community music organisations

Most of the community music organisations surveyed provided for a range of participants, including children, young people and adults, and offered both music tuition and performances. Over half said their activities centred on singing and composing, and half worked with classical or computer/electronic music. The most frequent events organised for young people were community-based performances and community workshops. This suggests that, in organisations that are not bound by a set syllabus or timetable constraints, there may be more opportunity to provide activity that links directly to the interests of young people involved.

7.4 Trends in participation

The second focus of the study was to examine trends in participation of young people in ensemble music making. There were three specific areas for investigation, relating to age, gender, and most relevant to this study, ethnic

origin. These trends, and the perceived underlying causes for them, are discussed in turn.

7.4.1 Age

Participants in the study were asked whether they had noticed any trends in participation of young people in ensemble music making which might be attributed to their age. The age-related trends observed were considered to apply to all young people, regardless of ethnic origin.

In the school survey over half the respondents reported that there were times when levels of participation in music-making activities decreased. These were thought to be in year 6, before transition to secondary school, and in year 9 in the transition from key stage 3 to key stage 4. Reasons given for the trends included peer pressure, family expectation, lack of positive role models and pressure from other, more academic, subjects, particularly when young people embarked on their GCSE courses. This was corroborated by those interviewed in the case studies, who remarked on a decrease in participation in key stage 4, in particular in year 11, when young people were under pressure of GCSE examinations. The literature (O'Neill *et al.*, 2001, for example) that we have accessed in this study focuses on the impact of transition from the primary to the secondary phase, rather than on the situation at key stage 4.

Similar trends were observed in the community music organisations, who felt that primary aged children and young people in years 7 to 9 enjoyed music more and had fewer inhibitions than older young people who participated less and had other pressures, such as schoolwork. Half of the organisations surveyed, however, did not think there were any trends in participation related to age.

7.4.2 Gender

Participants in the study were also asked whether they had noticed any differences in young people's participation in music-making activities which might be related to their gender. In the schools and community music organisations, half the respondents thought that there were differences in levels of participation between boys and girls, in that girls were more likely to participate in music-making activities than boys. The gender-related trends observed were considered to affect all young people, regardless of ethnic origin.

Reasons for differences in levels of participation included the fact that boys and girls were perceived to like different kinds of music-making activities and instruments. As the BERA Music Review Group (2001) stated: 'Teachers are aware, for example, that instruments are gendered and that activities like singing in the choir are very highly divided by virtue of gender' (p. 27). Respondents in the school survey and interviewees in the case study schools

commented that there was evidence of gender-stereotyping in the activities preferred by boys and girls. Whilst girls liked to play keyboards, strings, woodwind instruments and singing in a choir, boys preferred MC-ing, drumming and music technology. The fact that girls were perceived to sing more was thought to account for higher levels of participation among girls because schools had identified singing as one of their main music-making activities. Green (1996) reported that in her research, ‘the teachers and pupils overwhelmingly characterized girls as willing vocalists who enjoy singing lessons’ (p. 50), and this is generally the same message that we gained from our case study work. In addition to this, peer pressure was thought to account for lower levels of participation among the boys. This corroborates research reported by the BERA Music Review Group (2001) which found that ‘both girls and boys thought that a child of the same sex as themselves would be liked less, and bullied more, by other children, if they played an instrument that was viewed as “gender inappropriate”’ (p. 28).

The schools and community music organisations who reported no gender-related trends thought that all young people were given equal encouragement and there was a great enough diversity of activities on offer to ensure that all young people had the opportunity to participate.

7.4.3 Ethnicity

The third, and main, focus of the study’s examination of trends in young people’s participation was related to their ethnic origin. Participants in the study were asked to comment on differences between levels of participation of young people of white origin and young people of minority ethnic origin, and to comment on differences between minority ethnic groups. The data which emerged offered valuable insights into factors related to the music education provided in school and community organisations (such as the kind of repertoire on offer, and timing of extra-curricular activities) as well as factors outside music education (such as cultural traditions and parental preferences), which might have a bearing on levels of participation.

The data gathered for the study revealed a general view that levels of participation in music-making activities in schools were lower among young people of minority ethnic origin than young people of white origin both in and outside of the curriculum. One senior teacher in a case study school, for example, explained that 40 per cent of young people in the school taking instrumental tuition were of white origin, despite the fact that 85 per cent of the school’s population were of minority ethnic origin. Another remarked on the complete lack of engagement among Turkish young people in the school in music-making activities.

Another perceived trend related to young people’s uptake of different musical instruments. Half the respondents in the schools survey, for example, thought that there were trends for young people of minority ethnic origin to play

keyboard, piano, and string instruments, including guitar, but not ‘orchestral’ instruments, such as woodwind and brass.

Differences between ethnic groups in terms of level of participation in ensemble music making were also perceived by participants in the study. In the school survey the majority of respondents thought white British young people would participate in ensemble music making, whereas only half the respondents thought that young people of black African, black Caribbean, Indian, and Chinese origin would participate. A smaller number of respondents thought young people of Pakistani, Bangladeshi or other Asian origin would participate. This was corroborated by staff interviewed in the case studies who thought African-Caribbean young people would be more likely to participate in OSHL music making than young people of Pakistani or Bangladeshi ethnicity.

Participants in all phases of the study suggested a number of interrelating factors that might account for this variation in levels of participation. These included:

- lack of relevance of the music education provided
- logistical constraints
- financial constraints
- religious belief
- parental pressure
- cultural traditions.

In general, the view was expressed that music education, particularly in schools, lacked relevance for young people of minority ethnic origin in terms of provision of a variety of musical genres and opportunities for instrumental tuition. Kwami (1996) highlighted how the music curriculum in the United Kingdom was slow to include other musical genres. Though development appears to have taken place, with greater inclusion in evidence, there is still some way to go. Discussions with key individuals in Phase One of the study revealed that young people of minority ethnic origin were more likely to participate in music relating to their own cultural background and that this kind of music activity would more often be found outside formal music education, within, for example, Asian arts organisations, community groups, and other non-school environments. Similarly, community music organisations providing western music activities thought that young people of minority ethnic origin were more likely to participate in music representative of their own cultural background. This suggests that the school and community organisation curricula should be organic, and should develop and evolve in response to changing interest. Currently, efforts are being made to include young people in research focusing on the place of music and the link

to youth interest (for example, the Music Map project run by Sound Sense and funded by the Department for Education and Skills¹ (DfES)). Efforts such as this should ensure that policy makers and key actors and agencies become more aware of what young people are interested in, and offer provision accordingly. Our study suggests that a closer link between identified interest and provision may enhance the levels of involvement of young people, particularly those of minority ethnic origin.

It was noted that low numbers of Muslim young people were involved in ensemble music making. Reasons given for this included parental views, religious objections and logistical difficulties in attending music groups after school hours. In the case study schools, for example, staff remarked on the low status of music in Muslim parents' minds and their conviction that their children should focus on 'more academic' subjects. In addition to this, it was remarked that some Muslim parents disapproved of music on religious grounds. On a more practical level, music-making activities after school could conflict with attendance at mosque, and parents of Muslim girls, in particular, were unwilling for their daughters to travel home late from after-school activities. In some cases, it was reported that Muslim young people would conceal from their parents the fact that they were taking part in music groups, for fear of parents' disapproval. Pye *et al.* (2000) highlighted issues of familial difficulty arising from a dissonance between young Muslims, their families and their communities, as found in this preliminary study. Halstead (1994) discussed related issues in his study focusing on Muslim attitudes to music in schools. This suggests that the debates of the mid-1990s continue to have resonance today.

By way of contrast, African-Caribbean young people were thought to be more involved in music making, but this was predominantly outside formal education. Staff interviewed in the case studies described how African-Caribbean young people, in particular, were involved in music-making activities in the home and took part in gospel and church choirs. There was, however, very little connection between this activity and their music making at school. Staff commented, in particular, on their low participation in classical music activities at school, which they attributed to a lack of opportunity to experience classical music from an early age and the fact that it was perceived to be 'uncool'.

In the community organisations a slightly different story emerged. Just under half the organisations surveyed thought levels of participation were lower among young people of minority ethnic origin than young people of white origin, and those who did perceive lower levels of participation among young people of minority ethnic origin commented that this reflected the ethnic composition of their locality. Over half the community music organisations

¹ See www.soundsense.org

surveyed, however, had not noticed any differences between young people of minority ethnic origin and those of white origin in terms of participating in different musical genres.

7.5 Strategies to encourage participation

Examination of perceived differences in the participation of young people in music-making activities revealed that schools and community music organisations were aware of trends in participation related to the age, gender and ethnic origin of young people, and that participation of young people of minority ethnic origin was a particular issue. Some had indeed developed strategies to encourage young people of minority origin to participate, but these had not always been successful. Others had not developed strategies because there was uncertainty about how this issue should be addressed.

In those schools where some development in this area had taken place, the following approaches had been used:

- introduction of non-western musical genres to the curriculum
- cultural events with a focus on non-western musical genres (for example, drumming workshops)
- involvement of musicians of minority ethnic origin.

Though these approaches were being introduced, there was uncertainty about the effectiveness of these in encouraging greater participation. Despite this uncertainty, there appeared to be little in the way of monitoring and evaluation to assess the impact. In addition, amongst the case study schools at least, there appeared to be some lack of understanding among senior teachers as to what actually was being provided, how it was being funded and who was involved. Whilst this would appear to suggest that schools do not perceive involvement of minority ethnic young people as an issue, this is not the case. There is a desire to address the issue, but schools may not have the capacity, funding or time to do this.

In the community music organisations who responded to our survey, around half said they had developed strategies to encourage participation. Their approach was generally to encourage and advertise to everyone interested in playing music and to target provision accordingly. This approach appeared to be successful as half of the community organisations said they had carried out music activities related to the cultural background of minority ethnic young people in the last 12 months. These included local festivals of music and dance, percussion workshops and multi-cultural workshops.

While strategies clearly had been developed (albeit in less than half the schools and community music organisations surveyed) it is interesting to note that findings from all three phases of the study showed that these were not always the strategies considered to be most useful in encouraging the

participation of young people of minority ethnic origin in music-making activities. Strategies considered effective were:

- providing subsidies for music-making activities to ensure access for all (including the cost of instrument purchase or hire)
- encouraging parents to support their children in music making
- providing access to musicians of minority ethnic origin, who could provide positive role models for young people
- providing more training and support to music leaders
- working with different agencies, for example, schools, LEA music advisory services, other local organisations
- publicising music-making opportunities within the wider community
- widening opportunities for young people of minority ethnic origin.

7.6 Concluding remarks

This study has shown that issues highlighted in earlier research continue to have relevance in the current situation. Despite development made by schools and community organisations, there is still scope for advances to be made. It is evident that young people of minority ethnic origin do participate less in music making than young people of white origin, for the reasons highlighted above. This study has to be seen in the wider context of contemporary debates concerning music in society in general. For example, recent research on ballet conducted by the Royal Academy of Dance has raised concerns about the level of involvement of young people in that art form (Briggs, 2001). There is also debate on how to encourage adults to attend performances as attendance at live classical music events appears to be in decline. The Association of British Orchestras is investigating ways to make concerts more accessible to its audiences in an attempt to encourage engagement with music (Johnstone, 2005). All of this suggests that the issue of participation of young people of minority ethnic origin in ensemble music making is part of a much wider debate.

In the final chapter, we provide some issues for future consideration, derived from the findings of this preliminary study.

8. Issues for consideration

Organisations (schools and community music organisations) seeking to encourage the participation in ensemble music making by young people of minority ethnic origin will wish to consider that they:

- continue to ensure that their music activities incorporate elements which are of interest to all young people, regardless of ethnicity.
- continue to encourage the active involvement of young people from minority ethnic groups in Out of School Hours Learning (OSHL) activity.
- consider the specific cultural factors that mitigate against participation of young people from different ethnic groups.
- as far as possible, ring fence funding to ensure that young people can take up a musical instrument.
- as far as possible, encourage the involvement of musicians of minority ethnic origin to act as positive role models for young people. This involvement should be more than tokenistic.
- support events that showcase the musical culture and traditions of minority ethnic groups.
- have up to date music policies that highlight strategies and approaches for encouraging the involvement of young people of minority ethnic origin.
- should be encouraged not to view non-western music as homogenous, but rather be aware of the different traditions.
- make every attempt to engage with local community, religious and parental groups.
- should work more closely together to encourage greater links between in and out of school music-making activity.

More specifically, schools seeking to encourage the participation in ensemble music making by young people of minority ethnic origin will wish to consider that they continue to:

- ensure that their music curriculum incorporates elements which are of interest to all young people, regardless of ethnicity.
- encourage and develop a cross-curricular approach to the study of music, by bringing it into other subject areas.
- develop cross-phase activity to ensure that involvement in music is sustained as young people move from the primary to the secondary sector.

In their partnership with schools LEA music services may wish to:

- ensure that, as far as possible, the provision that they offer is attractive to the interests of all young people.

- consider the recruitment of more staff of minority ethnic origin.

Examination and Music Boards seeking to encourage the participation in ensemble music making by young people of minority ethnic origin will wish to consider the following:

- The Qualifications and Curriculum Authority (QCA) and the examination boards should continue to explore ways in which their programmes of study incorporate different musical genres and musical skills.

Policy makers and others interested in increasing the participation in ensemble music making by young people of minority ethnic origin will wish to:

- investigate ways in which organisations could be supported to enable them to develop their provision for young people of minority ethnic origin.

Other suggestions for consideration:

- Efforts should be made by training institutions (both in Further and Higher Education) to make their music provision more attractive to people of minority ethnic origin.
- Policy makers should investigate the strategies most useful in supporting organisations in developing their provision for young people of minority ethnic origin.
- Policy makers and other interested bodies should consider funding further research focusing on the involvement of young people of minority ethnic origin in music-making activity. This could investigate differences in participation between minority ethnic groups, and the factors that may account for these.

9. References

BRIDGWOOD, A., FENN, C., DUST, K., HUTTON, L., SKELTON, A. and SKINNER, M. (2003). *Focus on Cultural Diversity: the Arts in England. Attendance, Participation and Attitudes* (Arts Council England Research Report 34). London: Arts Council England.

BRIGGS, C. (2005). 'Fears raised over ballet future', *BBC News* [online]. Available: <http://news.bbc.co.uk/1/hi/entertainment/arts/4235881.stm> [9 February, 2005].

BRITISH EDUCATIONAL RESEARCH ASSOCIATION. MUSIC EDUCATION REVIEW GROUP (2001). *Mapping Music Education Research in the UK*. Southwell: BERA.

DEPARTMENT FOR EDUCATION AND SKILLS (2004). *The Music Manifesto: More Music for More People* [online]. Available: <http://www.musicmanifesto.co.uk/images/manifesto.pdf> [8 February, 2005].

GOODALL, H. (2004). 'A musical nation.' Television Documentary presented on the South Bank Show, ITV, 19 December.

GREEN, L. (1996). 'The emergence of gender as an issue in music education.' In: PLUMMERIDGE, C. (Ed) *Music Education: Trends and Issues* (Bedford Way Papers). London: University of London, Institute of Education.

HALLAM, S. and ROGERS, L. (2003). *Survey of Local Education Authorities' Music Services 2002* (DfES Research Report 478). London: DfES.

HALSTEAD, J.M. (1994). 'Muslim attitudes to music schools', *British Journal of Music Education*, **11**, 143–56.

HARLAND, J., KINDER, K., LORD, P., STOTT, A., SCHAGEN, I., HAYNES, J., CUSWORTH, L., WHITE, R. and PAOLA, R. (2000). *Arts Education in Secondary Schools: Effects and Effectiveness*. Slough: NFER.

HARRIS RESEARCH CENTRE (1993). *Black and Asian Attitudes to the Arts in Birmingham: Qualitative Research Findings Report*. Richmond: Harris Research Centre.

JOHNSTONE, H. (2005). 'Classical concert video guide hits all the right notes', *The Daily Telegraph*, 7 February, 9.

KWAMI, R. (1996). 'Music education in and for a multi-cultural society.' In: PLUMMERIDGE, C. (Ed) *Music Education: Trends and Issues* (Bedford Way Papers). London: University of London, Institute of Education.

MORRISON, R. (2005). 'Down the tubas: music is dying in our schools' (T2), *The Times*, 25 February, 4-5.

OFFICE FOR STANDARDS IN EDUCATION (2004). *Provision of Music Services in 15 Local Education Authorities* (HMI 2296). London: OFSTED.

O'NEILL, S., SLOBODA, J., BOULTON, M., RYAN, K., IVALDI, A. and LUCK G. (2001). *Young People and Music Participation Project: Practitioner Report and Summary of Findings* [online]. Available: <http://www.keele.ac.uk/depts/ps/ESRC/Preportall.doc> [8 February, 2005].

PEGGIE, A. (2002). *Tuning Up: a New Look at Instrumental Music Teaching*. Stowmarket: Sound Sense.

PYE, D., LEE, B. and BHABRA, S. (2000). *Disaffection Amongst Muslim Pupils: Exclusion and Truancy*. London: IQRA Trust.

QUALIFICATIONS AND CURRICULUM AUTHORITY (200?). *Respect for All in Music* [online]. Available: <http://www.qca.org.uk/1627.html>[8 February, 2005].

SKELTON, A., BRIDGWOOD, A., DUCKWORTH, K., HUTTON, L., FENN, C., CREASER, C. and BABBIDGE, A. (2002). *Arts in England: Attendance,*

Participation and Attitudes in 2001. Findings of a Study Carried Out by Social Survey Division of the Office for National Statistics. London: Marston Book Services.

WELCH, G.F. and ADAMS, P. (2003). *How is Music Learning Celebrated and Developed? A Professional User Review of UK and Related International Research Undertaken for the British Educational Research Association.* Southwell: BERA.

YOUTH MUSIC (2003). *Youth Music: Endangered & Protected Species* [Leaflet]. London: National Foundation for Youth Music.

Appendix 1



Participation in ensemble music making by young people of minority ethnic origin

Schedule for key individuals involved in music provision

Name	
Position	
Organisation	
Date	
Interviewer	

INTRODUCTION

- Thank you very much for agreeing to be interviewed today.
- The NFER have been asked by Youth Music to carry out a preliminary study to investigate the participation in ensemble music making by young people of minority ethnic origin.
- The purpose of this interview is to find out your thoughts and experiences about minority ethnic involvement in ensemble music making. The interview will take approximately 30 minutes.
- For the purpose of this interview, ensemble music making is taken to mean participation in group music-making activities (including both voice and instrumental music) organised by schools and community music organisations. The particular focus of this project is on young people aged 11 to 16.
- Discuss note-taking, recording and confidentiality.
- Any questions?

A BACKGROUND

A1 What is the main purpose of your organisation?

A2 What is your current role within your organisation?

A3 How long has your organisation been involved in ensemble music making activities? (*Prompt: e.g. all young people*)

B MUSIC PROVISION

B1 As you know, our focus is on young people of minority ethnic origin, do you feel there is sufficient provision for young people who may be interested in group music making? (*Prompts: Is there sufficient provision in the UK? in your area? Is there sufficient provision for young people, regardless of their background?*)

C TRENDS IN PARTICIPATION IN ENSEMBLE MUSIC MAKING

C1 To what extent do you feel young people of minority ethnic origin are participating in ensemble music making? (*Prompt: if appropriate ask about experiences*)

C2 Do you monitor trends amongst young people of minority ethnic origin in ensemble music making? (*Prompts: If 'Yes' how? Did you look at age groups, gender, ethnicity, religion?*)

C3 Have you noticed any trends in participation, related to young people of minority ethnic origin?

Only ask C4 and C5 if answered 'Yes' to QC3

C4 What do you think are the explanations for these trends? (*Prompts: lack of interest, peer pressure, relevance of music*)

C5 The general perception is that there is a low incidence of young people of minority ethnic origin participating in ensemble music making. What do you think are the main factors which contribute to this non-participation?

D MUSIC PREFERENCES

D1 Do you think the type of organisation affects the participation in music-making by young people of minority ethnic origin? (*Prompts: ethnically focused music organisations; schools – groups for all young people; leaders of groups*)

D2 Does the type of music repertoire affect the involvement of young people of minority ethnic origin? (e.g. *Prompts: What are their preferences, e.g. orchestra, steel band, quartet? Why are they attracted to these?*)

E STRATEGIES TO ENCOURAGE GREATER PARTICIPATION

E1 What initiatives is your organisation taking, if any, in order to encourage the participation of young people of minority ethnic origin? (*Probes: Have these been successful? Why/Why not?*)

E2 What do you think could be done in the future to encourage greater participation in music making amongst young people of minority ethnic origin?

F AOB

F1 Is there anything else you would like to add?

Thank you very much for your participation in this NFER preliminary study.

Appendix 2

Schools questionnaire.pdf



Survey of Heads of Music.pdf

Appendix 3

Community music organisations questionnaire.pdf



Survey of Community music organisations.pdf

Appendix 4



Participation in ensemble music making by young people of minority ethnic origin

Schedule for lead music teacher

Name	
Position in school	
School	
LEA	
Date	
Interviewer	

INTRODUCTION

- Thank you very much for agreeing to be interviewed today.
- The NFER have been asked by Youth Music to carry out a preliminary study to investigate the participation in ensemble music making by young people of minority ethnic origin.
- The purpose of this interview is to find out about your views on music participation in your school. The interview will take approximately an hour.
- Discuss note-taking, recording and confidentiality.
- Any questions?

A BACKGROUND

A1 Can you tell me about yourself? *What is your professional/musical background? How long have you worked at this school? Which subjects do you teach? Any management responsibility?*

A2 Before coming to this school, have you had any experience of teaching music to young people of minority ethnic origin?

B MUSIC PROVISION

B1 Can you please confirm how many full-time and part-time teachers there are in your department? *Are peripatetic music teachers included in that number? What are their specialisms? (playing an instrument or specific skill e.g. conducting choir)*

B2 Are any of your music staff of minority ethnic origin? *Which ethnic groups are they from?*

B3 Can you tell me what music provision is available to young people in school hours? *Which year groups are involved? (How many young people? Proportion of minority ethnic young people?) How many are taking music GCSE? (Proportion of minority ethnic young people?) How much time is allocated? What types of music do you have on the curriculum? What kinds of activities do students take part in during music lessons? Is any music provision targeted at specific ethnic groups?*

B4 Can you tell me what music provision your school makes available to young people outside school hours (in school i.e. lunch times, break times, after school)? *Which year groups are involved? (How many young people? Proportion of minority ethnic young people?) What types of music are offered? Is any music provision targeted at specific ethnic groups?*

B5 Do you work in partnership with other schools or community music organisations to provide musical activities or events? *In school and external? Primary and secondary schools? If yes, please describe these.*

C TRENDS IN PARTICIPATION IN ENSEMBLE MUSIC MAKING

- C1** Does your department record and monitor the characteristics of young people who participate in ensemble music making (including tuition, music groups and music events)? *If yes, how is this done? How often?*
- C2** In what ways are the data used?
- C3** Do you think that there are any trends apparent in your school among young people of minority ethnic origin participating in ensemble music making? *If yes, can you describe and explain these?*
- C4** Do you think the numbers of young people of minority ethnic origin involved in ensemble music making are related to the kinds of music provided in your school? *Are young people of minority ethnic origin attracted to any specific kinds of music?*
- C5** Do you think there are other factors (other than the kinds of music provided) which might affect the participation by young people of minority ethnic origin in ensemble music making? *e.g. financial factors, such as lack of funds for music tuition or instruments, religious factors, other factors?*
- C6** Do you think it is important to have music teachers of minority ethnic origin in your school? *Does this have an impact on levels of participation among young people of minority ethnic origin? Do you think they act as role models for minority ethnic young people?*
- C7** Are there any differences in the attitudes of parents from particular ethnic groups towards ensemble music-making activities? *Any impact on the kinds of music their children participate in? Any impact on the time when they participate e.g. after school, lunch times?*

C8 Do you think that participation in music-making activities by young people is influenced by their gender? *Please explain your response. Do you think the minority ethnic origin of young people impacts on this?*

C9 Do you think that participation in music-making activities by young people is influenced by their age? *Please explain your response. Do you think the minority ethnic origin of young people impacts on this?*

D STRATEGIES TO ENCOURAGE GREATER PARTICIPATION

D1 What strategies does your school use to encourage young people of minority ethnic origin to participate in ensemble music making? *Does the school provide financial subsidies for tuition or instruments e.g. from school funds or organisations such as Youth Music? Parental involvement? Is the music curriculum tailored to young people's interests? Are these strategies different from those adopted for young people in general?*

D2 Do you monitor these strategies? *Which strategies are successful/unsuccessful?*

E OVERVIEW

E1 What do you think are the main issues and challenges for your school in encouraging the participation of young people of minority ethnic origin in ensemble music-making activities? *What advice would you give to other schools?*

E2 What do you think could be done in schools in the future to encourage greater participation in music making among young people of minority ethnic origin?

F AOB

F1 Is there anything else you would like to add?

Thank you very much for your participation in this NFER preliminary study.



Participation in ensemble music making by young people of minority ethnic origin

Schedule for headteacher or senior teacher

Name	
Position in school	
School	
LEA	
Date	
Interviewer	

INTRODUCTION

- Thank you very much for agreeing to be interviewed today.
- The NFER have been asked by Youth Music to carry out a preliminary study to investigate the participation in ensemble music making by young people of minority ethnic origin.
- The purpose of this interview is to find out about your views on music participation in your school. The interview will take approximately 45 minutes.
- Discuss note-taking, recording and confidentiality.
- Any questions?

A BACKGROUND

A1 Can you tell me about yourself? *How long have you worked at this school? What subject did/do you teach?*

A2 Can you please confirm the following details about your school? *School type? Number of pupils on roll; % of boys and girls? % of EAL/Number of minority ethnic groups? % of free school meals? Attainment?*

B MUSIC PROVISION

B1 What place does music have within the curriculum?

B2 Does the school have a policy on music education? *Does this include a specific policy related to young people of minority ethnic origin?*

B3 What are your views on the music opportunities available for young people in your school? *For young people of minority ethnic origin? Young people in general?*

B4 Does the school allocate any specific funding to encourage young people of minority ethnic origin to participate in music?

B5 Do you work in partnership with other schools or community music organisations to provide musical activities or events? *If yes, please describe these? Are any of these specifically targeted at young people of minority ethnic origin? (primary and secondary schools)*

C TRENDS IN PARTICIPATION IN ENSEMBLE MUSIC MAKING

C1 Do you think that there are any trends apparent in your school among young people of minority ethnic origin participating in ensemble music making? *If yes, can you describe and explain these?*

C2 Do you think the numbers of young people of minority ethnic origin involved in ensemble music making are related to the kinds of music provided in your school? *Are young people of minority ethnic origin attracted to any specific kinds of music?*

- C3** Do you think there are other factors (other than the kinds of music provided) which might affect the participation by young people of minority ethnic origin in ensemble music making? *e.g. financial factors, such as lack of funds for music tuition or instruments, religious factors, other factors?*
- C4** Do you think it is important to have music teachers of minority ethnic origin in your school? *Does this have an impact on levels of participation by young people of minority ethnic origin?*
- C5** Are there any differences in the attitudes of parents from particular ethnic groups towards ensemble music-making activities? *Any impact on the kinds of music their children participate in? Any impact on the time when they participate e.g. after school, lunch times?*
- C6** Do you think that participation in music-making activities by young people is influenced by their gender? *Please explain your response. Do you think the minority ethnic origin of young people impacts on this?*
- C7** Do you think that participation in music-making activities by young people is influenced by their age? *Please explain your response. Do you think the minority ethnic origin of young people impacts on this?*

D STRATEGIES TO ENCOURAGE GREATER PARTICIPATION

- D1** What strategies does your school use to encourage young people of minority ethnic origin to participate in ensemble music making? *Does the school provide financial subsidies for tuition or instruments e.g. from school funds or organisations such as Youth Music? Parental involvement? Is the music curriculum tailored to young people's interests? Are these strategies different from those adopted for young people in general?*

D2 **What strategies are successful?** *For young people of minority ethnic origin? For young people in general? How do you know this? (i.e. any monitoring of strategies?)*

D3 **Are there any strategies which do not work?** *For young people of minority ethnic origin? For young people in general? How do you know this? (i.e. any monitoring of strategies?)*

E **OVERVIEW**

E1 **What do you think are the main issues and challenges for your school in encouraging the participation of young people of minority ethnic origin in ensemble music-making activities?**

E2 **What do you think could be done in schools in the future to encourage greater participation in music making among young people of minority ethnic origin?** *What advice would you give to other schools?*

F **AOB**

F1 **Is there anything else you would like to add?**

Thank you very much for your participation in this NFER preliminary study



Participation in ensemble music making by young people of minority ethnic origin

Schedule for young people

Name(s):
School:
Year group(s):
Date:
Interviewer:

A MUSIC PARTICIPATION AND FACTORS AFFECTING PARTICIPATION

A1 Can you tell me about what music you do in school? *How often do you have lessons and how long do they last? What do you like about these? What don't you like about these?*

A2 Do any of you play a musical instrument? *If yes, which ones? Why did you choose this instrument? (Probe: fun, easy, parental pressure) Do any of your friends also play an instrument?*

A3 What type(s) of music do you like? *Why? Can you learn about this music in/outside of school?*

A4 Are you part of any music groups in and outside of school? *If yes, why did you decide to join? What do you like about this? What don't you like about this?*

-
- A5** Do you think you will carry on playing a musical instrument? *Why? Why not?*
- A6** Have you taken part in any music events in your school in the last year? *Give details. What did you enjoy most about the event(s)? Had you ever done anything like (the event) before? What new things did you learn from the event(s)? Did you get to play any new instruments?*
- A7** Have you taken part in any other joint music activities with other schools or music groups? *Secondary and primary. Give details. Had you ever done anything like (the event) before? What new things did you learn from the event(s)? Did you get to play any new instruments?*
- A8** What does your family think about you doing music? *Do they play any musical instruments or participate in any music groups? If yes, which ones?*

B TRENDS IN PARTICIPATION IN ENSEMBLE MUSIC MAKING

- B1** Do young people of all ages take part in group music activities? *Why? Why not?*
- B2** Who takes part in the music groups and events you attend? *Are there roughly equal numbers of boys and girls?*
- B3** Did any of you give up taking part in any music activities when you came to this school? *Why? e.g. work pressure, social pressure, parental pressure, lack of opportunities.*

C ENCOURAGING GREATER PARTICIPATION

- C1** Is there anything to do with music making that you have really enjoyed in the past and would like to do again?
- C2** If you had the chance, is there anything you would really like to do in music making that you haven't done already? *Would you like to learn any other instruments/join any other groups?*
- C3** What do you think could be done in the future to encourage you to participate more in music-making activities? *(e.g. better range of activities, good teachers)*
- D** AOB
- D1** That was all I wanted to ask you, but is there anything that you would like to add?

Thank you very much for taking part.



Participation in ensemble music making by young people of minority ethnic origin

Schedule for headteacher of feeder primary school

Name	
Position in school	
School	
LEA	
Date	
Interviewer	

INTRODUCTION

- Thank you very much for agreeing to be interviewed today.
- The NFER have been asked by Youth Music to carry out a preliminary study to investigate the participation in ensemble music making by young people of minority ethnic origin.
- The purpose of this interview is to find out about your views on young people's music participation when they transfer from primary to secondary school. The interview will take approximately half an hour.
- Discuss note-taking, recording and confidentiality.
- Any questions?

A BACKGROUND

A1 Can you tell me a little bit about your school? *Number on roll; % of boys and girls? % of EAL/Number of minority ethnic groups? % of free school meals? Attainment?*

A2 Approximately how many of your pupils transfer to [add name] secondary school? *The majority? Small numbers?*

B MUSIC PROVISION

- B1** **Does the school have a policy on music education?** *If yes, is any area of the policy specifically concerned with young people of minority ethnic origin? Is there anything in the policy about transition from the primary to the secondary phase?*
- B2** **What place does music have in primary schools in general?**
- B3** **What place does music have in secondary schools in general?**
- B4** **What strategies do you use to encourage young people of minority ethnic origin to participate in ensemble music making?**
- B5** **Do you work in partnership with your secondary school to provide musical activities or events?** *What do you do? Do you target any of these activities at young people of minority ethnic origin?*
- B6** **Do you work in partnership with community organisations to provide musical activities or events?** *What do you do? Do you target any of these activities at young people of minority ethnic origin?*

C TRENDS IN PARTICIPATION IN ENSEMBLE MUSIC MAKING

- C1** Do you think that there are any trends apparent in your school among young people of minority ethnic origin participating in ensemble music making? *Can you please explain these? Are these the same in the secondary phase?*
- C2** Do you think the numbers of young people of minority ethnic origin involved in ensemble music making in the secondary phase are related to the kinds of music provided? *Are young people of minority ethnic origin attracted to any specific kinds of music?*
- C3** Do you think there are other factors (other than the kinds of music provided) which might affect the participation of young people of minority ethnic origin in ensemble music making in the secondary phase? *e.g. financial factors, such as lack of funds for music tuition or instruments, religious factors, other factors?*
- C4** Are there any differences generally in the attitudes of parents from particular ethnic groups towards ensemble music-making activities? *In the primary and the secondary phase? Any impact on the kinds of music their children participate in? Any impact on the time when they participate e.g. after school, lunch times?*
- C5** Does the transition from primary to secondary school have any impact on levels of participation in music making? *Among young people in general? Among young people of minority ethnic origin? Why do you think this is?*

D OVERVIEW

D1 What do you think are the main issues and challenges for schools in general in encouraging the participation by young people of minority ethnic origin in ensemble music-making activities? *Challenges and issues for primary schools? Challenges and issues for secondary schools?*

D2 What do you think could be done in secondary schools in the future to encourage greater participation in music making by young people of minority ethnic origin? *What advice would you give to other schools? Do you have any advice relating to transfer from primary to secondary school?*

E AOB

E1 Is there anything else you would like to add?

Thank you very much for your participation in this NFER preliminary study



Participation in ensemble music making by young people of minority ethnic origin

Schedule for community music leader

Name:	
Position in organisation:	
Organisation:	
Location:	
Date:	
Interviewer:	

INTRODUCTION

- Thank you very much for agreeing to be interviewed today.
- The NFER have been asked by Youth Music to carry out a preliminary study to investigate the participation in ‘ensemble’, or group, music making by young people of minority ethnic origin.
- The purpose of this interview is to find out about your views on music participation in your organisation. The interview will take approximately an hour.
- Discuss note-taking, recording and confidentiality.
- Any questions?

A BACKGROUND

A1 *Can you tell me about yourself? What is your background? How long have you worked here? What do you do here?*

A2 *Can you tell me about this organisation? What are its aims and objectives? Size, in terms of participants? % of boys and girls? % of minority ethnic*

young people? Number of minority ethnic groups? How is it funded? Do young people have to pay to come here?

A3 Before coming to this organisation, have you had any experience of working with young people of minority ethnic origin?

B MUSIC PROVISION

B1 Can you please confirm how many full-time and part-time staff there are here? What are their specialisms? (playing an instrument or specific skill e.g. conducting choir)

B2 How many of the people who work here are of minority ethnic origin? Which ethnic groups are they from? Do you think it is important to have staff of minority ethnic origin? Does this have an impact on levels of participation among young people of minority ethnic origin? Do you think they act as role models for minority ethnic young people?

B3 Can you tell me what you provide for young people here? When do they come? How long do the sessions last? How do they get here? Which age groups are involved? What types of music do they play? What kinds of activities do young people take part in? Are any activities targeted at specific ethnic groups?

B4 Do you work in partnership with other local community music organisations or schools to provide musical activities or events? Which ones? Primary and secondary schools?

C TRENDS IN PARTICIPATION IN ENSEMBLE MUSIC MAKING

C1 Do you think that participation in music-making activities by young people is influenced by their gender? Please explain your response. Do you think the minority ethnic origin of young people impacts on this?

-
- C2** Do you think that participation in music-making activities by young people is influenced by their age? *Please explain your response. Do you think the minority ethnic origin of young people impacts on this?*
- C3** Do you think that there are any trends apparent in your organisation among young people of minority ethnic origin participating in ensemble music making? *If yes, can you describe and explain these?*
- C4** Do you think the numbers of young people of minority ethnic origin involved in ensemble music making are related to the kinds of music provided in your organisation? *Are young people of minority ethnic origin more involved in any specific kinds of music?*
- C5** Do you think there are other factors (other than the kinds of music provided) which might affect the participation by young people of minority ethnic origin in ensemble music making? *e.g. financial factors, such as lack of funds for music tuition or instruments, availability of hiring instruments? religious factors? social factors? location of organisation? parents?*
- C6** Are there any differences in the attitudes of parents from particular ethnic groups towards ensemble music-making activities both here and elsewhere? *Any impact on the kinds of music their children participate in? Any impact on the time when they participate e.g. after school, weekends, holidays?*

D STRATEGIES TO ENCOURAGE GREATER PARTICIPATION

- D1** What strategies do you use to encourage young people of minority ethnic origin to participate? *Do you provide financial subsidies for tuition or instruments? Parental involvement? Is the music tailored to minority ethnic young people's interests? Are these strategies different from those adopted for young people in general?*

D2 **Do you monitor these strategies? Which strategies are successful/ unsuccessful? Is there any other monitoring e.g do you keep track of who participates? If yes, how is this done? How often? What do you do with the information you collect?**

E OVERVIEW

E1 **What do you think are the main issues and challenges for your organisation in encouraging the participation of young people of minority ethnic origin in ensemble music-making activities? What advice would you give to other organisations?**

E2 **What do you think could be done in organisations in the future to encourage greater participation in music making among young people of minority ethnic origin?**

E3 **How do you see your organisation's work developing in the future for minority ethnic young people?**

F AOB

F1 **Is there anything else you would like to add?**

Thank you very much for your participation in this NFER preliminary study.



Participation in ensemble music making by young people of minority ethnic origin

Schedule for young people in community organisations

Name(s):
Organisation:
Location:
Date:
Interviewer:

INTRODUCTION

- Explain who I am: (name & from NFER)
- What I do: job involves visiting places across the country to talk to young people and community leaders about education issues
- Why I'm visiting this organisation: to find out about their participation in music-making activities in the local community
- Explain that the interview is confidential and that no one else will be told what they say
- Ask if we can record the interview to help with note taking
- Ask if there are any questions before the interview starts.

A BACKGROUND

A1 Can I ask you all about your backgrounds? How old are you? Do you live locally? How long have you been coming to this group?

B MUSIC PARTICIPATION

B1 **Why do you come here?** *How often do you come here? How long do you spend here? What time do you meet up? Did anyone suggest you come here?*

B2 **What do you like about coming here?** *What don't you like about coming here? How is it different from music activities at your school? What type(s) of music do you like? Why? Can you do this music here?*

B3 **What musical instruments, if any, do you play?** *Why did you choose this instrument? (Probe: fun, easy, parental pressure) Do any of your friends also play an instrument?*

B4 **Have you taken part in any music events here in the last year?** *Give details. What did you enjoy most about the event(s)? Had you ever done anything like (the event) before? What new things did you learn from the event(s)? Did you get to play any new instruments?*

B5 **Have you taken part in any other joint music activities with other music groups or schools?** *Give details. Had you ever done anything like (the event) before? What new things did you learn from the event(s)? Did you get to play any new instruments?*

B6 **What does your family think about you doing music?** *Do they play any musical instruments or participate in any music groups? If yes, which ones?*

C TRENDS IN PARTICIPATION IN ENSEMBLE MUSIC MAKING

C1 **Who takes part in group music activities here?** *Do young people of all ages take part? Are there roughly equal numbers of boys and girls? Please give details.*

D ENCOURAGING GREATER PARTICIPATION

D1 If you had the chance, is there anything you would really like to do in music making that you haven't done already? *Would you like to learn any other instruments/join any other groups?*

D2 What do you think could be done in the future to encourage you to participate more in music-making activities? *(e.g. better range of activities, good teachers)*

D4 Do you think you will carry on coming here? Why? why not?

E AOB

E1 That was all I wanted to ask you, but is there anything that you would like to add?

Thank you very much for taking part.

Appendix 5: Technical Appendix

Survey of heads of music in secondary schools

The schools sample

Questionnaires were distributed to a sample of 497 heads of music in secondary schools in September 2004. In order to achieve a sample of schools where the population of pupils was as ethnically diverse as possible, the sample was structured according to two variables. The first variable was the recorded percentage of white pupils in the school; the second variable was the number of different ethnic groups in the school.

The sample included only those schools where the percentage of white pupils was 90 per cent or below, in order to ensure that all the schools approached would have at least some non-white pupils. In addition to this, the sample was stratified by the number of ethnic groups. The majority of schools had a large number of different ethnic groups (most over 12 different groups), and the sample was split as follows:

- five per cent of schools had one to six ethnic groups
- 25 per cent of schools had seven to 12 ethnic groups
- 38 per cent of schools had 13 to 15 ethnic groups
- 32 per cent of schools had 16 to 18 ethnic groups.

The 500 schools were distributed within the four main types of Local Education Authority:

- Counties: 196 schools (39 per cent)
- London Boroughs: 121 schools (24 per cent)
- Metropolitan Authorities: 111 schools (22 per cent)
- Unitary Authorities: 72 schools (14 per cent).

(Owing to rounding, these figures do not sum to 100 per cent)

Sample Representation

The schools involved were generally representative of the school population as a whole, with the exception of school type, as shown in Table A5.1:

**Table A5.1 : MFY Heads of Music questionnaire
Representation of the Sample (schools)**

		0 population		1 sample	
		Number	%	Number	%
School type	8 Middle deemed Secondary	58	4	12	7
	9 Secondary Modern	59	4	4	2
	10 Comprehensive to 16	513	35	56	34
	11 Comprehensive to 18	739	50	66	40
	12 Grammar	103	7	27	16
	13 Other Secondary schools	14	1		
Type of LEA	1 Metropolitan	749	50	78	47
	2 Non-metropolitan	737	50	87	53
LEA type	1 London Borough	390	26	41	25
	2 Metropolitan Authorities	359	24	37	22
	3 English Unitary Authorities	238	16	19	12
	4 Counties	499	34	68	41
Region	1 North	271	18	24	15
	2 Midlands	500	34	66	40
	3 South	715	48	75	45
No of ethnic groups	1 1-6	71	5	11	7
	2 7-12	367	25	34	21
	3 13-18	1048	71	120	73
Total schools		1486	100	165	100

Since percentages are rounded to the nearest integer, they may not always sum to 100.